

Professor Brian Livesley MD FRCP
Code A

pager
tel:
fax:
email:

Code A

10 July, 2001

Detective Superintendent John James
Major Incident Complex
Fratton Police Station
Kingston Crescent, North End
Portsmouth
Hampshire PQ2 8BU

Your ref: MIC/D.Supt/JJ/MK

Dear Detective Superintendent James

RE: OPERATION ROCHESTER

Enclosed please find a copy of my Medical Report concerning the above.

Yours sincerely

Brian Livesley

Royal Mail specialdelivery record of postage (by Professor Brian Livesley of Medical Report: concerning the case of Gladys Mable Richards deceased with header of 'Richards - BL/ med rep Jul 01') to **Det. Sup. John James** stamped **10 JI 01** with **guaranteed delivery date 11 07 01.**

Front

Obverse

Royal Mail[®]

specialdelivery

guaranteed next working day by 12 noon

write details of where your item is going

Name
Det. Sup. John James

Building (name or number) and street

Code A

You can automatically claim up to £250 compensation for lost or damaged items

tick if your item is worth more than £250 and you want a higher compensation limit for an extra price

Tick one level: ~~up to £1,000~~ up to £2,500

write your address on the back of the package

hand this label and your package in at a post office

Reference
SU 0899 1420 5GB

12

your receipt Keep this in case you need to claim

For post office completion

Guaranteed delivery date
11 07 01

Level of Consequential Loss
Apply payment to package

£

Total price paid
3.95

Date of delivery
10 07 01

Initials
DJ

For confirmation of delivery...
Call 0845 700 1200 after 1pm on day of delivery or visit our Web site www.royalmail.com and quote:
SU 0899 1420 5GB

If your item is delivered late...
We'll give you your money back if we haven't attempted to deliver your item by 12 noon on the date shown above. Please note, later guaranteed delivery times apply for remote parts of Scotland. Deliveries to and from the Channel Islands and the Isle of Man can be delayed by Customs. For details of how to claim call 0845 7 740 740 calls charged at local rates

If your item is lost or damaged...
We'll pay you compensation for the value of your item, up to the level paid for. For a claim form call 0845 7 740 740 calls charged at local rates, or pick one up at a post office
If you have taken out Consequential Loss compensation, ask at a post office for our terms and conditions

Copy

Receipt & Fradon confirmed by telephone on 11 July 2001

Code A

9 August 2013

**Medical Report:
concerning the case of Gladys Mable Richards deceased**

Prepared for:

Hampshire Constabulary
Major Crime Complex, Fratton Police Station, Kingston Crescent,
North End, Portsmouth, Hampshire PO2 8BU

by: Professor Brian Livesley MD FRCP
The University of London's Professor in the Care of the Elderly

Code A

For the purpose of ... providing an independent view about treatment given to Mrs Gladys RICHARDS and the factor(s) associated with her death.

Synopsis

1. At the age of 91 years, Mrs Gladys RICHARDS was an in-patient in Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital.
 - 1.1. A registered medical practitioner prescribed the drugs diamorphine, haloperidol, midazolam, and hyoscine for Mrs Gladys RICHARDS.
 - 1.2. These drugs were to be administered subcutaneously by a syringe driver over an undetermined number of days.
 - 1.3. They were given continuously until Mrs RICHARDS became unconscious and died.
 - 1.4. During this period there is no evidence that Mrs RICHARDS was given life sustaining fluids or food.
 - 1.5. It is my opinion that as a result of being given these drugs, Mrs RICHARDS's death occurred earlier than it would have done from natural causes.
-

CONTENTS

	page no.
1. The writer's declaration	3
2. Introduction	3
3. Information relating to Mrs Gladys RICHARDS (deceased).....	3
4. Relevant aspects of Mrs RICHARDS's medical history	4
5. Drugs prescribed for Mrs RICHARDS at Gosport War Memorial Hospital	11
6. Death certification and cremation.....	14
7. Conclusions	14
8. My opinion	16
9. Appendix A – the documents I have received and read	18
10. Appendix B – facts of the environment obtained from the statements of Mrs RICHARDS's daughters.....	22
11. Appendix C – Glossary	28
12. Appendix D – Texts used for reference.....	30
13. Appendix E – My qualifications and experience.....	31
14. My signature and dating of this report.....	34

The writer's declaration

1. This report consisting of thirty-four pages is true to the best of my knowledge and belief and I make it knowing that if tendered in evidence, I shall be liable for prosecution if I have wilfully stated in it anything that I know to be false or do not believe to be true.

Introduction

2. The documents with which I have been provided and the visits I have made to the hospitals involved in this enquiry are listed in the Appendix A.
 - 2.1. Appendix B contains facts of the environment provided by the statements of Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE (the elder daughter of Mrs Gladys RICHARDS (deceased)) and Mrs Lesley Frances LACK (the younger daughter).
 - 2.2. I have indicated any medical terms in **bold type**. I have defined these terms in a glossary in Appendix C.
 - 2.3. I have included in Appendix D references to published material.
 - 2.4. Appendix E contains details of my qualifications and experience.
 - 2.5. This report has been presented on the basis of the information available to me—should additional information become available my opinions and conclusions may be subject to review and modification.

Information relating to Mrs Gladys Richards (deceased)

3. Mrs Gladys Mable RICHARDS (née Beech) was born on Code A and died on 21st August 1998 aged 91 years.
 - 3.1. Mrs Richards has two daughters. They are Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE (the elder daughter) and Mrs Lesley Frances LACK.
 - 3.1.1. Mrs Lack is a retired Registered General Nurse. She retired during 1996 after 41 years continuously in the nursing profession. For 25 years prior to her retirement she was involved in the care of elderly people. For 20 years prior to retirement she held supervisory and managerial positions in this particular field of nursing.
 - 3.2. The Glen Heathers Nursing Home is a private registered nursing and residential home at Lee on the Solent, Hampshire. Dr J BASSETT is a general practitioner who visits.

- 3.3. The Royal Hospital Haslar is an acute general hospital in Gosport, Hampshire serviced by the Armed Forces at the time of the incident but available as a National Health Service facility to local people.
- 3.4. Gosport War Memorial Hospital is part of the Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust.
 - 3.4.1. Daedalus ward is a continuing care and rehabilitation ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital.
- 3.5. Dr Jane Ann BARTON is a registered medical practitioner who in 1988 took up a part-time post as clinical assistant in elderly medicine. This post became centered at Gosport War Memorial Hospital. She retired from this part-time post in the year 2000.
- 3.6. Mr Philip James BEED is the clinical manager and charge nurse on Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital. Ms Margaret COUCHMAN and Ms Christine JOICE are registered general nurses who were working on Daedalus ward at the time of the incident.
- 3.7. Dr Anthea Everista Geredith LORD is a consultant physician, within the department of elderly medicine of Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust, who was usually responsible for the patients on Daedalus ward and who was on study leave on 17/18 August 1998.
 - 3.7.1. Other consultant physicians from the department of elderly medicine provide on-call consultant physician cover when Dr LORD is absent from duty.

Relevant aspects of Mrs RICHARDS's medical history

4. Mrs RICHARDS became resident at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home on 5th August 1994 at the age of 87 years and although disorientated and confused she was able to wash and dress herself and able to go up and down stairs and walk well.
 - 4.1. It is noted that she also had a past medical history of bilateral deafness for which she required hearing aids.
 - 4.1.1. Unfortunately both of her hearing aids were lost by December 1997 while she was at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home and had not been replaced by July 1998 when she was admitted to Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital).
 - 4.1.2. It is noted that on 8th July 1998 her general practitioner, Dr J BASSETT wrote to the audiologist at Queen Alexandra Hospital, Cosham requesting an 'URGENT [sic]' domiciliary visit to Glen Heathers Nursing Home. This was '... with a view to supplying her [Mrs RICHARDS] with two new hearing aids.... Since her poor hearing probably contributes to her

confusional state I would be grateful if you would visit with a view to fitting of replacement aids as soon as possible please.'

- 4.2. It is also noted that Mrs RICHARDS had had operations for the removal of cataracts and required glasses.
 - 4.2.1. Unfortunately her spectacles were also lost at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home and had not been replaced by August 1998 when she was admitted to Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital.
 - 4.2.2. As Dr BASSETT had noted Mrs RICHARDS poor hearing probably contributed to her confusional state. The absence of her spectacles would also make it difficult for Mrs RICHARDS to be aware of what was going on around her, further aggravate her confusional state due to lack of sensory stimulation, and increase her dependency on others for her normal daily activities.
 - 4.2.3. The absence of both her hearing aids and her spectacles would make the assessment of and communication with Mrs RICHARDS extremely difficult.
 - 4.2.3.1. It is noted that such sensory deprivation can produce and aggravate confusional and disorientated states.
- 4.3. At the beginning of 1998, she had become increasingly forgetful and less able physically but was inclined to wander and she had about a six months' history of falls.
- 4.4. On 29th July 1998, at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home, Mrs RICHARDS developed a fracture of the neck of her right femur [thighbone] and she was transferred to the Royal Hospital Haslar, Gosport.
 - 4.4.1. In the Accident & Emergency department she was given 2.5mg of **morphine** and 50 mg of **cyclizine** at 2300 hours to relieve her pain and distress. She was known to be taking **haloperidol** 1mg twice daily and **Tradazone** 100mg at night.
- 4.5. On 30th July 1998 Mrs RICHARDS had a right cemented hemiarthroplasty [an artificial hip joint inserted].
 - 4.5.1. Post-operatively she was given 2.5 mg **morphine** intravenously on July 30th at 0230 hours, 31st at 0150 and 1905 hours, and on August 1st at 1920 hours and 2nd at 0720 hours. From August 1st -7th she was weaned over to two tablets of **co-codamol**, requiring these on average twice daily for pain relief.
 - 4.5.2. On 3rd August 1998 it was noted 'All well. Sitting out early mobilization'.

- 4.6. On 5th August 1998, Dr REID, a consultant geriatrician, saw her. He stated in a letter that ‘... she appeared to have a little discomfort on passive movement of the right hip. I understand that she has been sitting out in a chair and I think that, despite her dementia, she should be given the opportunity to try to re-mobilise. I will arrange for her transfer to Gosport Memorial Hospital.’
- 4.6.1. Dr REID also noted that Mrs RICHARDS had continued on Haloperidol and ‘... her Trazodone has been omitted. According to her daughters it would seem that since her Tradozone has been omitted she has been much brighter mentally and has been speaking to them at times.’
- 4.7. A discharge letter, dated 10th August 1998, was sent by the sergeant staff nurse at the Royal Hospital Haslar and addressed to ‘The Sister in Charge Ward [sic] Memorial Hospital, Bury Road, Gosport, Hants.’ It contained the following information:-
- 4.7.1. After the operation Mrs RICHARDS became ‘...fully weight bearing, walking with the aid of two nurses and a **Zimmer frame**.’ She was noted to require ‘total care with washing and dressing, eating and drinking....’ She was ‘... continent, when she become[s] fidgety and agitated it means she wants the toilet....’ She ‘Occasionally says recognisable words, but not very often.’ Her wound ‘Is healed, clean and and dry.’
- 4.8. On 11th August 1998, Mrs RICHARDS was transferred to Daedalus ward at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital. She was not in pain and had been fully weight bearing at the Royal Hospital Haslar walking with the aid of two nurses and a Zimmer frame.
- 4.8.1. At the Gosport War Memorial Hospital there was an unsigned ‘Summary’ record which is apparently a Nursing record and this states:-
- 4.8.1.1. ‘11-8-98 Addmitted [sic] from E6 Ward Royal Hospital Haslar, into a continuing care bed. Gladys had sustained a right fractured neck of Femur on 30th July 1998 in Glen Heathers Nursing Home. She has had a right cemented hemi-arthroplasty and she is now fully weight bearing, walking with the aid of two nurses and a Zimmer frame. Daughter visits regularly and feeds mother. She wishes to be informed Day or night of any deterioration in mothers condition....’
- 4.8.2. The contiguous ‘Assessment Sheet’ states, ‘Patient has no apparent understanding of her circumstances due to her impaired mental condition ... Deaf in both ears ... Cataract operation to both eyes ... occasionally says recognisable words, but not very often ... soft diet. Enjoys a cup of tea ... requires feeding ... Dental/Oral status Full “Set” – keeps teeth in at night.’

- 4.8.3. The 'Patient Medication Information' states, '11.8.98 ... Haloperidol O[rally] 1 mcg [looks like 'mcg' but probably is 'mg' since this drug is not prescribed in single **microgram** doses] B.D. [twice daily]'
- 4.9. ??[initials]B [subsequently identified as Dr BARTON] has written in the medical case records '11-8-98 Transferred to Daedalus Ward Continuing Care.... O/E [on examination] Impression frail demented lady [paragraph] not obviously in pain [paragraph] Please make comfortable [paragraph] transfers with hoist Usually continent needs help with **ADL [activities of daily living]**.... I am happy for nursing staff to confirm death.'
- 4.10. At 1300 hours on the 13th August 1998 the Nursing Contact Record states 'Found on floor at 13.30hrs [sic]. Checked for injury none apparent at time hoisted into safer chair 20.00 [hours][altered on record to 19.30] pain Rt [right] hip internally rotated. Dr BRIGG contacted advised Xray AM [in the morning] & **analgesia** during the night. Inappropriate to transfer for Xray this PM [evening] [initialled signature (? by whom)] RGN [Registered General Nurse] [next line] Daughter informed.'
- 4.11. Dr BARTON has recorded '14-8-98 Sedation/pain relief has been a problem screaming not controlled by haloperidol 1 [illegible symbol or word] but very sensitive to **oramorph**. Fell out of chair last night ... Is this lady well enough for another surgical procedure?'
- 4.12. In her contiguous note Dr BARTON has recorded '14-8-98 Dear [?] Cdr [Commander] SPALDING Further to our telephone conversation thank you for taking this unfortunate lady who slipped from her chair at 1.30 pm yesterday and appears to have dislocated her R[ight] hip.... She has had 2.5ml of 10mg/5ml Oramorph at midday.'
- 4.12.1. According to the letter signed by Philip BEED, Mrs RICHARDS was given 10mgs of Oramorph at 1150 hours on 14th August 1998 prior to being transferred back to the Royal Hospital Haslar.
- 4.13. The Nursing Contact Record at Daedalus ward continues:-
- 4.13.1. '14/8/98 am [morning] R[ight] Hip Xrayed – Dislocated [paragraph] Daughter seen by Dr BARTON & informed of situation. For transfer to Haslar A&E [accident and emergency department] for reduction under sedation [initialled signature]'
- 4.13.2. 'pm [afternoon or evening of 14th August 1998] Notified that dislocation has been reduced. [Mrs RICHARDS] To stay in Haslar [hospital] for 48 hours then return to us [[initialled signature] Family aware.'
- 4.14. At the Royal Hospital Haslar (at 1400 hours) Xray having confirmed that the hemiarthroplasty had dislocated, intravenous sedation using 2 mgs of midazolam

allowed the dislocation to be corrected by traction. The procedure was described as 'Under sedation c [with] CVS/RS [cardiovascular and respiratory systems] monitoring. ... Easy reduction.' Mrs RICHARDS was noted to be 'rather unresponsive following the sedation. The [She] gradually became more responsive....' She was then admitted the Royal Hospital for 48 hours observation.

4.15. Apart from two tablets of co-codamol on the 15th August 1998, she did not need to be given any pain relief following the reduction of her hip dislocation.

4.15.1. Two days later, on 17th August 1998, it was recorded that 'She was fit for discharge that day and she was to remain in straight knee splint for four weeks. In the discharge letter from Haslar Hospital it was also recorded that Mrs RICHARDS was to return to Daedalus Ward. It was further stated that 'She has been given a canvas immobilising splint to discourage any further dislocation, and this must stay in situ for four weeks. When in bed it is advisable to encourage abduction by using pillows or abduction wedge. She can however mobilise fully weight bearing.'

4.16. On 17th August 1998 it was also recorded that she was 'Fit for discharge today (Gos[port] War Mem[orial hospital]). To remain in straight knee splint for 4/52 [four weeks] ... No follow-up unless complications.'

4.17. She was returned to Daedalus ward in the Gosport War Memorial Hospital later that day but in a very distressed state. The Daedalus ward nursing record states 'Returned from R.N. Haslar, patient very distressed appears to be in pain. No canvas under patient – transferred on sheet by crew To remain in straight knee splint for 4/52 [four weeks] For pillow between legs at night (abduction) No follow-up unless complications.'

4.17.1. Mrs RICHARDS was given Oramorph 2.5 mg in 5mls. The nursing record for 17th August 1998 further states '1305 [hours] ... Daughter reports surgeon to say her mother must not be left in pain if dislocation occurs again. Dr Barton contacted and has ordered an Xray. M. COUCHMAN. [paragraph] pm Hip Xrayed at 1545 [hours] Films seen by Dr PETERS & radiologist & no dislocation seen. For pain control overnight & review by Dr BARTON mane [in the morning]. ?[illegible nurse signature]

4.17.1.1. This radiograph was reported by Dr. DOMJAN, Consultant Radiologist as showing 'RIGHT HIP: The right hemiarthroplasty is relocated in the **acetabulum**.'

4.18. On 17th August 1998, Dr BARTON noted 'Readmission to Daedalus from RHH [Royal Hospital Haslar] Closed reduction under iv [intravenous] sedation remained unresponsive for some hours now appears peaceful. Plan Continue haloperidol [paragraph] Only give oramorph if in severe pain See daughter again.'

- 4.19. On 18th August 1998, Dr BARTON recorded ‘Still in great pain [paragraph] Nursing a problem. [paragraph] I suggest sc[subcutaneous] diamorphine/Haloperidol/midazolam [paragraph] I will see daughters today [paragraph] please make comfortable.’
- 4.20. The nursing Contact Record on Daedalus ward in the Gosport War Memorial Hospital continues:-
- 4.20.1. ‘18/8/98 am Reviewed by Dr Barton. For pain control via syringe driver. [paragraph] 1115 Treatment discussed with both daughters [Mrs LACK and Mrs MACKENZIE]. They agree to use of **syringe driver** to control pain [It is noted that Mrs LACK has disagreed with this statement] & allow nursing care to be given. [paragraph] 1145 Syringe driver diamorphine 40 mg. Haloperidol 5 mg, Medazolam [midazolam] 20 mg commenced’
- 4.20.2. ‘18/8/98 20.00 Patient remained peaceful and sleeping. Reacted to pain when being moved – this was pain in both legs. [paragraph] Daughter quite upset and angry about mother’s condition, but appears happy that she is pain free at present. C JOICE.’
- 4.20.2.1. It is noted that a ‘disturbance reaction’ occurs in patients when they are moved that is easily mistaken for pain requiring specific treatment. It is noted here that Mrs RICHARDS was described as being ‘pain free’ at this time apart from when she was being moved.
- 4.20.3. The nursing Contact Record continues ‘Daughter, Jill, stayed the night with Gladys [Mrs RICHARDS], grandson arrived in early hours of morning [initialled signature; dated ‘19/8/98’] [paragraph] He would like to discuss Grand mother’s condition with someone – either Dr. Barton or Phillip Beed later today [initialled signature]’ [paragraph] ‘19/8/98 am Mrs Richards comfortable. [paragraph] Daughters seen. Unhappy with various aspects of care, complain[t] to be handled officially by Mrs S Hutchings Nursing co-ordinator [initialled signature]’
- 4.20.4. It is noted that there is no continuing nursing Contact Record for the 20th August 1998.
- 4.20.5. The contiguous nursing Contact Record states ‘21/8/98 12.13 [hours] Patient’s [Mrs RICHARDS] overall condition deteriorating, medication keeping her comfortable. Daughters visited during the morning. C JOICE’
- 4.21. Dr BARTON’s next contiguous medical record was on 21st August 1998 when she wrote ‘Much more peaceful [paragraph] needs Hyoscine for rattly chest’.

- 4.21.1. It is noted that Mrs RICHARDS was already being given hyoscine at this time and had been doing so continuously since 19th August 1998.
- 4.21.2. Nurse GRIFFIN made the next note in the medical records on 21st August 1998 stating that Mrs Richards was dead at 2120 hours.
- 4.22. The Nursing Care Plan records state:-
- 4.22.1. '12.8.98 Requires assistance to settle and sleep at night.... 12.8.98 Haloperidol given at 2330 [hours] as woke from sleep very agitated shaking and crying. Didn't settle for more than a few minutes at a time. Did not seem to be in pain.'
- 4.22.2. '13.8.98 oromorph at 2100 [hours] Slept well [initialled signature] [paragraph] For Xray tomorrow morning [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.3. '14.8.98 Same pain in rt[right] leg / ?[query] hip this am. [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.4. 'Re-admitted 17/8/98'
- 4.22.5. '17.8.98 Oromorph [Oramorph] 10mg/5ml at present.'
- 4.22.6. '18.8.98 Now has a syringe driver with 40mgs Diamorphine – comfortable. Daughters stayed. [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.7. 'Daughters stayed with Gladys [Mrs RICHARDS] overnight. [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.8. There is no record of continuance of the Nursing Care Plan for 20th and 21st August 1998.
- 4.22.9. After Mrs RICHARDS had been readmitted to Daedalus ward on 17th August 1998, there is no record between 17th and 21st August 1998 in the patient Nursing Care Plan for 'Nutrition'. On 21st August the record states 'no food taken [initialled signature]'.
4.22.9.1. There is no record that Mrs RICHARDS was offered any fluids.
- 4.22.10. Similarly, the Nursing Care Plan for 'Constipation' shows no record between 17th and 21st August 1998. On 21st August the record states 'BNO [bowels not open] [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.11. The Nursing Care Plan for 'Personal Hygiene' states:-

- 4.22.11.1. '18.8.98 Complete Bed Bath given plus oral [Signature] Hygiene [second signature]'
- 4.22.11.2. '18.8.98 Night: oral care given frequently'
- 4.22.11.3. '19.8.98 Nightie changed & washed, repositioned. Apparently pain free during care [initialled signature]'
- 4.22.11.4. It is noted that there is no record of Mrs Richards being attended to for 'Personal Hygiene' on 20th August 1998.
- 4.22.11.5. '21.9.98 General care and oral hygiene given [initialled signature]'
- 4.23. The drugs prescribed for Mrs RICHARDS at Gosport War Memorial Hospital from the time of her admission there on 11th August 1998 are described below.

Drugs prescribed for Mrs RICHARDS at Gosport War Memorial Hospital

5. Dr BARTON wrote the following drug prescriptions for Mrs RICHARDS.
- 5.1. On 11th August 1998:-
- 5.1.1. Oramorph 10mgs in 5mls to be given orally four hourly. On the Administration Record these doses are recorded as being given—
- 5.1.1.1. twice on 11th August 1998 (10mg at 1015 [?1215] and 10mg at 1145 [?pm]);
- 5.1.1.2. once on 12th August (10mg at 0615);
- 5.1.1.3. once on 13th August (10mg at 2050);
- 5.1.1.4. once on 14th August (5ml [10mg] at 1150);
- 5.1.1.5. four times on 17th August (2.5ml [5mg] at 1300, 2.5ml [5mg] at [time illegible], 2.5ml [5mg] at 1645, and 5ml [10mg] at 2030); and,
- 5.1.1.6. twice on 18th August 1998 5ml [10mg] at 01230[sic and ? meaning 0030 hours] and 5ml [10mg] at [?]0415).
- 5.1.2. Diamorphine at a dose range of 20 – 200 mg to be given subcutaneously in 24 hours.

- 5.1.2.1. None of this diamorphine prescription is recorded on the Administration Record as having been given between 11th – 14th August inclusive.
- 5.1.3. Hyoscine at a dose range of 200 – 800 mcg [micrograms] to be given subcutaneously in 24 hours.
- 5.1.3.1. None of this hyoscine prescription is recorded on the Administration Record as having been given between 11th – 14th August inclusive.
- 5.1.4. Midazolam at a dose range of 20-80 mgs to be given subcutaneously in 24 hours.
- 5.1.4.1. None of this midazolam prescription is recorded on the Administration Record as having been given between 11th – 14th August inclusive.
- 5.1.5. Haloperidol 1mg orally twice daily. It is noted that at the top of this prescription chart 'TAKES MEDICINE OFF A SPOON' [sic] is clearly written.
- 5.1.5.1. She was give 1mg of haloperidol at 1800 hours on 11th August 1998, at 0800 and 2330 hours on 12th August 1998, at 0800 and 1800 hours on 13th August 1998.
- 5.1.5.2. In addition, on 13th August 1998, Mrs RICHARDS was prescribed haloperidol 2mgs in 1ml to be administered orally as required at a dose of 2.5ml [this figure has been altered and also can be read as 0.5 ml] to be given 'IF NOISY' [sic]. She was given a dose [quantity not stated bearing in mind the altered prescription] at 1300 on 13th August 1998.
- 5.1.5.3. She was also given 1mg of haloperidol at 0800 hours on 14th and also at 1800 hours on 17 August 1998.
- 5.1.6. It is noted that, apart from 2330 hours on 12 August 1998, at the above times when Mrs RICHARDS was given haloperidol she was also give 10ml of **Lactulose** [a purgative].
- 5.2. On 12th August 1998:-
- 5.2.1. Oramorph 10mgs in 5mls to be given orally in a dose of 2.5 mls four hourly [equivalent to 5mgs of oramorph].

- 5.2.1.1. Although this drug was apparently not administered its prescription was written up on the 'Regular Prescription' chart but at the side in an ink-drawn box there are the letters PRN [meaning that the prescription is to be administered as required].
- 5.2.2. Oramorph 10mgs in 5mls to be given orally once at night.
 - 5.2.2.1. Although this drug was apparently not administered its prescription was also written up on the 'Regular Prescription' chart but at the side in an ink-drawn box there are the letters PRN [meaning that the prescription is to be administered as required].
- 5.3. 18th August 1998:-
 - 5.3.1. Diamorphine at a dose range of 40-200mg to be administered subcutaneously in 24 hours
 - 5.3.2. Haloperidol a dose range of 5-10 mgs to be administered subcutaneously in 24 hours.
- 5.4. On 18th, 19th, 20th, and 21st August 1998, Mrs RICHARDS was given simultaneously and continuously subcutaneously diamorphine 40mgs, and haloperidol 5mgs, and midazolam 20mgs during each 24 hours.
 - 5.4.1. These drugs are recorded as being administered at the same time of day on each of the four days they were given. They were administered at 1145, 1120, 1045, and 1155 for 18th, 19th, 20th, and 21st August 1998 respectively.
 - 5.4.1.1. All these drugs were administered at the times stated and were signed off by initials as being co-administered by the same person each day. Over the four days of 18th, 19th, 20th, and 21st August 1998, at least three nurses were involved in administering these drugs.
 - 5.4.1.2. According to the prescription charts these drugs were signed for as being administered to Mrs RICHARDS via the syringe driver by Mr Philip BEED on 18th and 19th August 1998, by Ms Margaret COUCHMAN on 20th August 1998, and by Ms Christine JOICE on 21st August 1998.
 - 5.4.2. It is noted that on the 19th, 20th, and 21st August 1998 the drugs midazolam 20mgs, diamorphine 40mgs, and haloperidol 5mgs were also co-administered subcutaneously in 24 hours with 400mcg of hyoscine [this last drug had been

prescribed by Dr BARTON to be given as required on 11th August 1998 but its administration was not commenced until 19th August 1998].

5.4.3. It is also noted that all the drugs for subcutaneous administration were not prescribed at specific starting dosages but each was prescribed for a wide range of dosages and for continuous administration over 24-hour periods.

5.4.3.1. It is not known who selected the dosages to be given.

Death certification and cremation

6. The circumstances of Mrs RICHARDS death have been recorded as follows:
 - 6.1. In a document [Case no. 1630/98] initialled by the Coroner on 24th August 1998 'Reported by Dr BARTON [sic]. Deceased had undergone surgery for a fractured neck of femur. Repaired. Death cert[ificate] issued. [paragraph] THOMAS [sic]
 - 6.2. The cause of death was accepted by the Coroner on 24th August 1998 as being due to:-
 - 6.2.1. '1(a) Bronchopneumonia'.
 - 6.2.2. The death was certified as such by Dr J A BARTON and registered on 24th August 1998.
 - 6.2.3. It is noted that the continuous subcutaneous administration of diamorphine, haloperidol, midazolam, and hyoscine to an elderly person can produce unconsciousness and death from respiratory failure associated with pneumonia.
 - 6.3. The body was cremated.

Conclusions

7. Mrs Gladys Mable RICHARDS died on 21st August 1998 while receiving treatment on Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital.
 - 7.1. Some four years earlier, on 5th August 1994, Mrs RICHARDS had become resident at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home.
 - 7.2. Mrs RICHARDS's had a confused state that after December 1997 had been aggravated by the loss at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home of her spectacles and both of her hearing aids.

- 7.3. On 29th July 1998, Mrs RICHARDS developed a fracture of the neck of her right femur [thighbone] and she was transferred from the Glen Heathers Nursing Home to the Royal Hospital Haslar, Gosport.
- 7.4. Despite her confused state, Mrs RICHARDS was considered by medical staff at the Royal Hospital Haslar to be suitable for implantation of an artificial hip joint. This took place on 30th July 1998.
- 7.5. On 11th August 1998, and having been seen by a consultant geriatrician, Mrs RICHARDS was transferred for rehabilitation to Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital.
- 7.6. At that time Dr BARTON recorded that Mrs RICHARDS was not obviously in pain but despite this Dr BARTON prescribed Oramorph [an oral morphine preparation] to be administered orally four hourly.
 - 7.6.1. At that time also Dr BARTON prescribed for Mrs RICHARDS diamorphine, hyoscine, and midazolam. These drugs were to be given subcutaneously and continuously over periods of 24 hours for an undetermined number of days and the exact dosages were to be selected from wide dose ranges.
 - 7.6.2. Also on 11th August 1998, at the end of a short case note, Dr BARTON wrote 'I am happy for nursing staff to confirm death'.
 - 7.6.3. It is noted that although prescribed on the day of her admission to Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial Hospital these drugs (diamorphine, hyoscine, and midazolam) were not administered at that time.
- 7.7. On 13th August 1998, Mrs RICHARDS's artificial hip joint became dislocated.
- 7.8. The following day, 14th August 1998, although Dr BARTON had recorded 'Is this lady well enough for another surgical procedure?' she arranged for Mrs RICHARDS to be transferred back to Haslar Hospital where the dislocation of the hip was reduced.
 - 7.8.1. It is noted that at the age of 91 years, and despite Dr Barton's comment about Mrs RICHARDS, and her confused mental state, Mrs RICHARDS was considered well enough by the staff at the Royal Hospital Haslar to have two operations on her right hip within about two weeks.
- 7.9. Three days later, on 17th August 1998, Mrs RICHARDS was returned to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital on a sheet and not on a stretcher. She was very distressed when she reached Daedalus ward.

- 7.10. There is no evidence that Mrs RICHARDS, although in pain, had any specific life-threatening and terminal illness that was not amenable to treatment and from which she could not be expected to recover.
- 7.11. Despite this, and on 18th August 1998, Dr BARTON, while knowing of Mrs RICHARDS's sensitivity to oral morphine and midazolam, prescribed diamorphine, midazolam, haloperidol, and hyoscine to be given (from wide dosages ranges) continuously subcutaneously and by a syringe driver over periods of 24 hours for an unlimited period.
- 7.11.1. Neither midazolam nor haloperidol is licensed for subcutaneous administration.
- 7.11.2. It is noted, however, that in clinical practice these drugs are administered subcutaneously in the management of distressing symptoms during end-of-life care for cancer.
- 7.11.3. It is also noted that Mrs RICHARDS was not receiving treatment for cancer.
- 7.12. There is no evidence that in fulfilling her duty of care Dr BARTON reviewed appropriately Mrs RICHARDS's clinical condition from 18th August 1998 to determine if any reduction in the drug treatment being given was indicated.
- 7.13. During this period when a syringe driver was being used to administer the subcutaneous drugs, there is no evidence that Mrs RICHARDS was given fluids or food in any appropriate manner.
- 7.14. There is no evidence that in fulfilling their duty of care Mr Philip BEED, Ms Margaret COUCHMAN and Ms Christine JOICE reviewed appropriately Mrs RICHARDS's clinical condition from 18th August 1998 to determine if any reduction in the drug treatment they were administering was indicated.
- 7.15. There is, however, indisputable evidence that the subcutaneous administration of drugs by syringe driver continued without modification and during every 24 hours from 18th August 1998 until Mrs RICHARDS died on 21st August 1998.
- 7.16. Dr Barton recorded that death was due to bronchopneumonia.
- 7.16.1. It is noted that the continuous subcutaneous administration of diamorphine, haloperidol, midazolam, and hyoscine to an elderly person can produce unconsciousness and death from respiratory failure associated with pneumonia.

My opinion

8. When Mrs RICHARDS was first admitted to Daedalus ward at Gosport War Memorial hospital on 11th August 1998 she was not in pain and had been fully weight bearing walking with the aid of two nurses and a Zimmer frame.
- 8.1. Despite recording that Mrs RICHARDS was not in pain, on 11th August 1998 Dr BARTON prescribed wide dosage ranges of opiate and sedative drugs to which Mrs RICHARDS was known to be sensitive.
 - 8.1.1. Dr Barton also recorded that 'I am happy for nursing staff to confirm death.' when Mrs RICHARDS had been admitted for rehabilitation and her death was not obviously imminent.
- 8.2. When, at the age of 91 years, Mrs RICHARDS dislocated her operated hip and despite her confused mental state, she was considered well enough to have a second operation on her right hip within about two weeks of the first operation.
- 8.3. There is no evidence to show that after her second operation Mrs RICHARDS, although in pain, had any specific life-threatening and terminal illness that was not amenable to treatment and from which she could not be expected to recover.
- 8.4. It is my opinion, and there is evidence to show, that Mrs RICHARDS was capable of receiving oral medication for the relief of the pain she was experiencing on 17th August 1998.
- 8.5. Mrs RICHARDS was known by Dr BARTON to be very sensitive to Oramorph, an oral morphine preparation, and to have had a prolonged sedated response to intravenous midazolam.
- 8.6. Despite this, and from 18th August 1998 for an undetermined and unlimited number of days, Dr BARTON prescription led over 24-hours periods to the continuous subcutaneous administration to Mrs RICHARDS of diamorphine 40mgs, haloperidol 5mgs, and midazolam 20mgs to which was added hyoscine 400mcg from 19th August 1998.
- 8.7. The administration of these drugs continued on a 24-hours regime without their dosages being modified according to Mrs RICHARDS's response to them and until Mrs RICHARDS died on 21st August 1998.
- 8.8. There is no record that Mrs RICHARDS was given any food or fluids to sustain her from the 18th August 1998 until she died on 21st August 1998.

- 8.9. As a result of the continuous subcutaneous administration of the prescribed drugs diamorphine, haloperidol, midazolam, and hyoscine Mrs RICHARDS became unconsciousness and died on 21st August 1998.
- 8.10. No other event occurred to break the chain of causation and in my opinion Mrs RICHARDS's death was directly attributable to the administration of the drugs she continuously received by syringe driver from 18th August 1998 until her death on 21st August 1998.
- 8.11. It is my opinion that Mrs Gladys RICHARDS's death occurred earlier than it would have done from natural causes and was the result of the continuous administration of diamorphine, haloperidol, midazolam, and hyoscine which had been prescribed to be administered continuously by a syringe driver for an undetermined number of days.

APPENDIX A

14. I have received and read the following documents:-
- 14.1. The letter of DCI BURT dated 22nd November 1999 that gave an initial overview of the case.
- 14.2. The documents in the file DCI BURT presented at our meeting on 28th January 2000 as follows:-
- 14.2.1. 1) Draft (unsigned) statement (MG11) of Lesley HUMPHREY.
- 14.2.2. 2) Copy of PEC (NHS) T Health Record (LH/1/C).
- 14.2.3. 3) Copy of RHH Medical Record (AF/1/C).
- 14.2.4. 4) Draft (unsigned) statement (MG11) of Gillian MACKENZIE.
- 14.2.5. 5) Draft (unsigned) statement of Lesley LACK.
- 14.3. The documents in the file DCI BURT presented at our meeting on 8th March 2000 including those pursuant to my request of 28th January 2000 (documents WX1, WX2, and YZ were forward to me on 9 March 2000) as follows:-
- 14.3.1. A Typed copy of Notes prepared by Mrs LACK and given to Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust
- 14.3.2. B Typed copy of additional page of notes which was prepared by Mrs LACK but, apparently, not passed to Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust
- 14.3.3. C Typed copy of Notes prepared by Mrs LACK and given to Social Services
- 14.3.4. D Typed copy of comments made by Mrs LACK in respect of letter from Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust which represented a response to her Notes of complaint (A)

- 14.3.5. E Typed copy of comments made by Mrs LACK in respect of a Report prepared by Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust which resulted in the letter referred to above
- 14.3.6. F As D above but made by Mrs MACKENZIE
- 14.3.7. G As E above but made by Mrs MACKENZIE
- 14.3.8. HI Copy of letter written by Mrs MACKENZIE to DI MORGAN (OIC of initial investigation) plus 5 copies newspaper cuttings
- 14.3.9. JK Copy of Coroner's Officer's Form
- 14.3.10. L Copy of letter from Dr REID to S/Cdr SCOTT
- 14.3.11. M Copy of Report made by Dr LORD during original investigation
- 14.3.12. N Copy of additional newspaper cutting
- 14.3.13. O (1) Typed copy of signed statement of Anne FUNNELL (RHH)
- 14.3.14. O (2) Typed copy of signed statement of Lesley HUMPHREY (Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust)
- 14.3.15. O (3) Copy of signed statement of Lesley LACK
- 14.3.16. O (4) Copy of final draft of Gillian MACKENZIE's statement
- 14.3.17. PQ Copy of schedule of x-ray images (RHH)
- 14.3.18. R Copy of Risk Event Record (Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust)
- 14.3.19. S (1) Copy of letter which DCI BURT has sent to Lesley HUMPHREY (Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust) raising various issues
- 14.3.20. S (2) Copy of entries in medical directories 1998/1999 - Dr Jane Ann BARTON
- 14.3.21. S (3) Copy of letter from Mrs MACKENZIE to DCI BURT
- 14.3.22. S (4) Copy of documents which accompanied the two Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust x-ray images
- 14.3.23. T Copy of various documents which featured in a Social Services Case Conference stemming from receipt of Mrs LACK's Notes of complaint (C above)
- 14.3.24. UV Copy of Death Certificate - Mrs RICHARDS
- 14.3.25. WX1 Witness Statement of Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE dated March 6 2000
- 14.3.26. WX2 Copy of letter from DR J.H. BASSETT to Mrs MACKENZIE with an addendum of five pages being a photocopy from 'Toxic Psychiatry' a book by Dr Peter BREGGEN published by Harper Collins.
- 14.3.27. YZ Two extracts from 'Criminal Law. Diana Rowe. Hodder & Stoughton 1999.'

14.4. On 8th March 2000, in the presence of DCI BURT, I visited:-

- 14.4.1. the Gosport Memorial Hospital and followed the passageways along which Mrs Richards was conveyed and the ward areas in which she was treated; and,
- 14.4.2. the Royal Hospital Haslar and followed the passageways along which Mrs Richards was conveyed and the ward area in which she was treated.

14.4.2.1. At the Royal Hospital Haslar, on 8th March 2000, in the presence of DCI BURT, I was also shown twelve (12) radiographs relating to Mrs Richards' treatment there on 12th April 1998, 17th July 1998, 14th August 1998, 29th July 1998, and 31st July 1998.

14.5. In addition I have read the following the documents given to me by DCI BURT on 12th May 2000 consisting of the following which are numbered below as listed in the two containing ring binders:

- 14.5.1. E 25 Copy of Glen Care Homes file Re: Gladys RICHARDS supplied by Glen Care Homes
- 14.5.2. E 22 Copy of Hampshire County Council Social Services file Re: Gladys RICHARDS
- 14.5.3. E23 Copy of Glen Care Homes file Re: Gladys RICHARDS supplied Nursing Homes Inspectorate
- 14.5.4. E 24 Copy Portsmouth and South East Hampshire Health Authority GP Patient Records of Gladys RICHARDS
- 14.5.5. D 63 Police letter 090300 to Miss CROSS, Haslar Hospital with further questions
- 14.5.6. D 65 Letter 100400 from Miss CROSS at Haslar including Patient transfer order and further medical records
- 14.5.7. D 104 Letter 080200 from Mrs. MACKENZIE with notes Re: draft statement
- 14.5.8. D 108 Portsmouth NHS Trust Dept. of Diagnostic Imaging report folder
- 14.5.9. D 110 Copy typed Gladys RICHARDS Death Certificate dated 240898

14.6. I have also read the documents given to me by DCI BURT on 19th July 2000, consisting of copies of the statements made by:-

- 14.6.1. JOICE Christine
- 14.6.2. GIFFIN Sylvia Roberta
- 14.6.3. PULFORD Monica Catherine
- 14.6.4. WALKER Fiona Lorraine
- 14.6.5. MARJORAM Catherine
- 14.6.6. BALDACCHINO Linda Mary
- 14.6.7. PERKINS Margaret Joan
- 14.6.8. TUBBRITT Anita
- 14.6.9. COUCHMAN Margaret
- 14.6.10. WALLINGTON Kathleen Mary
- 14.6.11. FLETCHER Anne
- 14.6.12. COOK Joanne
- 14.6.13. MOSS JEAN Kathleen
- 14.6.14. TYLER Christina Ann

14.7. I have also read statements, provided on 30th August 2000 by DCI BURT, made by:

- 14.7.1. Doctor Jane Ann BARTON
- 14.7.2. Phillip James BEED

14.8. I have also received from DCI BURT on 8th September 2000 and read copies of:-

14.8.1. A letter dated 18th August 2000 from Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE to DCI BURT.

14.8.1.1. Enclosed with this letter was a copy of a letter dated 9th August 2000 from Ms Jill BAKER to Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE to which had been added a petition form.

14.9. A letter dated 21st August 2000 from Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE to DCI BURT.

14.9.1. Enclosed with this letter was a copy of a letter dated 14th December 1998 from Ms Lesley HUMPHREY, Quality Manager at Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust Central Office to Mrs Gillian MACKENZIE. This had enclosed with it a copy of a letter dated 22nd September 1998 from Mr Max MILLETT, Chief Executive of Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust.

14.10. Copies of Witness Statements (taken by Mrs S HUTCHINGS who led the initial Internal Inquiry as Investigating Officer of Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust) as follows:-

14.10.1. On 3rd September 1998 statement consisting of four pages from Mrs Jenny BREWER – Staff Nurse Daedalus Ward to which is attached an additional statement (three pages) by Staff Nurse Brewer (the first page of this three pages is headed Portsmouth Healthcare NHS Trust and has been signed on page three by S. N J Brewer RGN and dated 9-9-98 (Reference D142)).

14.10.2. On 8th September 1998 statement consisting of five pages from Mr Philip BEED – Clinical Manager Daedalus Ward (Reference D143).

14.10.3. On 9th September 1998 statement consisting of three pages from Ms Christine JOICE – Staff Nurse Daedalus Ward (Reference D144).

14.10.4. On 8th September 1998 statement consisting of two pages from Ms Monica PULFORD – Enrolled Nurse Daedalus Ward (Reference D145).

14.10.5. On 3rd September 1998 statement consisting of four pages from Ms Margaret COUCHMAN – Staff Nurse Daedalus Ward (Reference D146).

- 14.11. A copy of the National Council for Hospice and Specialist Palliative Care Services paper entitled 'Ethical decision-making in palliative care'.
- 14.12. On 5th and 6th October 2000 I received from Hampshire Constabulary and subsequently read:-
- 14.12.1. The records of the interviews conducted with Dr Anthea Everista Geredith LORD on 27th September 2000.
- 14.12.2. During these interviews Dr LORD produced as listed in the Officer's Report by DC McNally the following documents:-
- 14.12.2.1. Drug Therapy Guidelines for subcutaneous fluid replacement as approved by the Elderly Medicine and Formulary & Medicines Group of Portsmouth Hospitals and Portsmouth Healthcare updated for 1998.
- 14.12.2.2. Consultants' Rota for August 1998 of the Department of Medicine for Elderly People (Ref: CI/28.7.98).
- 14.12.2.3. Memorandum from Mrs. L HUMPHREY of Portsmouth Health Care NHS Trust to Dr. LORD dated 17th December 1998 and headed 'Mrs. Richards deceased, Gosport War Memorial Hospital, 21st August, 1998.'
- 14.12.2.4. Letter from Dr R I REID, Medical Director of Portsmouth Health Care NHS Trust giving approval of study leave for Dr. LORD for the dates of 17/18 August 1998.
- 14.12.2.5. Consultants' Timetable of the Department of Medicine for Elderly People from 4.5.98 – 8.2.99.

Appendix B

Facts of the environment - obtained from the statements of Mrs RICHARDS's daughters

15. Mrs MACKENZIE is the elder of Mrs RICHARDS's two daughters. It is noted that her sister, Mrs LACK, is a retired Registered General Nurse.
- 15.1. Mrs LACK retired in 1996 after 41 years continuously in the nursing profession. For 25 years prior to retirement she was involved in the care of elderly people. For 20 years prior to retiring she held supervisory and managerial positions in this field of nursing.

- 15.2. By July 1998, Mrs RICHARDS had been resident at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home for some four years. She had a past medical history of bilateral deafness for which she required two hearing aids (unfortunately these were lost while she was at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home). She had had operations for the removal of cataracts and required glasses (unfortunately these were also lost at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home).
- 15.3. Also by July 1998, Mrs RICHARDS had become increasingly forgetful and less able physically. She had had 17 falls documented at the Glen Heathers Nursing Home between 29th January 1998 and 29th July 1998.
- 15.3.1. During this period Mrs MACKENZIE decided to meet and question her mother's general practitioner, Dr BASSETT. Mrs MACKENZIE had formed the opinion that the drugs Dr BASSETT was prescribing could contribute to her mother's confused mental state and deterioration of her physical health. One drug was Trazodone and the other was haloperidol. Following this meeting she sent him a copy of a book entitled *Toxic Psychiatry*.
- 15.3.2. Dr BASSETT replied, in a hand-written letter, thanking Mrs MACKENZIE and stating '... I have a reputation in Lee [-on-Solent] of being somewhat sparing with 'mood' drugs and especially antibiotics. ... most drugs are prescribed with more caution these days. [paragraph] Hopefully we can continue to keep your Mother's drugs to a minimum!'
- 15.4. It is convenient to mention here that both Mrs MACKENZIE and Mrs LACK have registered serious concerns about the care given to their mother in the Glen Heathers Nursing Home.
- 15.4.1. Jane PAGE, Principal Nursing Home Inspector, Portsmouth & S.E. Hants Health Authority investigated these concerns formally. On 11th August 1998, she made an unannounced visit to the Glen Heathers Nursing Home. She reported, on 26th August 1998, that 'From the written records obtained and discussions held, I can find no evidence to substantiate that Mrs RICHARDS did not receive appropriate care and medication.'
- 15.4.2. These concerns were discussed further by the Social Services Department at a meeting held on 23rd November 1998 when Mrs LACK was present. The conclusion was that 'There was no evidence of deliberate abuse [of Mrs RICHARDS] although there seemed to be problems of complacency in some of the care practices which needed review.... However, there was no evidence of malpractice by the Home.'
- 15.5. On 29th July 1998, while in the Glen Heathers Nursing Home, Mrs RICHARDS sustained a fracture of the neck of her right femur (thighbone). According to Mrs

LACK her mother underwent a surgical operation on 30th July 1998 'following a discussion with the consultant who thought my mother should be given the chance to remain ambulant.'

15.6. Mrs LACK has also stated:-

15.6.1. 'My mother received a replacement hip, on her right side, and remained in the Haslar Hospital a further eleven days until Tuesday the 11th August 1998. [paragraph] I visited my mother every day during this period and, in my view, when taking into account the serious injury which she had sustained and the trauma she had suffered, my mother appeared to make a good recovery during this period.'

15.6.2. 'Prior to her discharge, and transfer to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital, my mother was responding to physiotherapy, able to walk a short distance with the aid of a zimmer frame and no longer required a catheter. Her medication had been reduced and she was able to recognise family members and make comments to us which made sense.'

15.6.3. 'She was with encouragement, eating and drinking naturally and as a result the drips, which had facilitated the provision of nourishment after the operation, had been removed.'

15.6.4. 'Significantly, my mother was no longer in need of pain relief. It was quite apparent, to me, that she was free of pain.'

15.6.5. 'Such was the extent of my mother's recovery that it was considered appropriate to discharge her and transfer her to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital where she was admitted to Daedalus Ward on Tuesday the 11th August 1998. This was the first occasion that my mother had been admitted to this particular hospital.'

15.7. On 12th August 1998, the day after her mother's admission to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital, Mrs LACK visited her mother there and has recorded '... I was rather surprised to discover that I could not rouse her [Mrs RICHARDS]. As she was unrousable she could not take nourishment or be kept hydrated. [paragraph] I enquired among the staff and I was told that my mother had been given the morphine based drug 'Oramorph' for pain. This also surprised me. When my mother had been discharged from the Haslar Hospital, the day before, she had not required pain relief for several days. [paragraph] I was distressed to observe my mother's deteriorated condition which significantly contrasted with the level of recovery which had been achieved following treatment at the Haslar hospital during the period after the surgical operation to replace her hip. [paragraph] I was told that my mother had been calling out, showing signs of being anxious, and it was believed that she was suffering pain. They did not investigate the possible cause. I consider it likely that she was in need of the toilet. ... One of the

consequences of being rendered unrousable, by the effects of 'Oramorph', was that no fluids could be given to my mother and this, together with the abandonment of other forms of rehabilitation, would have served to inhibit or prevent the recovery process which had begun prior to her admission to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital.'

- 15.8. Mrs RICHARDS had a fall on 13th August 1998 (as described above). On the following morning (14th August 1998), Mrs LACK noted that while her mother was being taken to the X-ray department at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital 'She was still deeply under the effects of the 'Oramorph' drug.'
- 15.9. As described above Mrs RICHARDS was then transferred to the Royal Hospital Haslar for the reduction of her dislocated artificial hip. She was returned to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital on 17th August 1998 having been noted the previous day (16th August) by Mrs LACK [a nurse experienced in the care of elderly people] to be 'easily manageable'.
 - 15.9.1. In accepting that he would transfer Mrs RICHARDS to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital, Dr REID (consultant geriatrician) had stated that '... despite her dementia, she [Mrs RICHARDS] should be given the opportunity to try to re-mobilise.'
- 15.10. On visiting her mother at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital at about 1215 hours on 17th August 1998, Mrs LACK accompanied by her sister [Mrs MACKENZIE], found her mother to be screaming and in pain. The screaming ceased 'within minutes' when Mrs LACK and a registered general nurse repositioned Mrs Richards.
- 15.11. Subsequently, the X-ray at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital showed no fresh dislocation of the artificial hip.
- 15.12. Following this further X-ray, Mrs LACK told Dr BARTON that Haslar Hospital would be prepared to readmit her mother. Dr BARTON is reported to have '... felt that was inappropriate.' Mrs LACK '... considered this was essential so that the 'cause' of my mother's pain could be treated and not simply the pain itself.'
 - 15.12.1. Dr BARTON is stated to have said to Mrs LACK that, '... "It was not appropriate for a 91 year old, who had been through two operations, to go back to Haslar Hospital where she would not survive further surgery." '
- 15.13. Mrs LACK states that, on 18th August 1998, the Ward Manager [Mr Philip BEED] explained to her and her sister that a syringe driver was going to be used. This was to ensure Mrs RICHARDS 'was pain free at all times' so that she would not suffer when washed, moved, or changed in the event she should become incontinent. Mrs LACK has also described in her contemporaneous notes (as well as in her Witness Statement, see below) that 'A little later Dr BARTON appeared and confirmed that a haematoma

was present and that this [the use of a syringe driver] was the kindest way to treat my mother. She [Dr BARTON] also stated "And the next thing will be a chest infection." '.

15.13.1. In her Witness Statement, Mrs LACK has recorded 'The outcome of the syringe driver was explained to my sister and I fully. Drawing on my experience as a nurse I [Mrs LACK] knew that the continuous use of morphine, as means of relieving her pain, could result in her death. She [Mrs RICHARDS] was, at the time, unconscious from the effects of previous doses of 'Oramorph' [paragraph] As result of seeing my mother in such great pain I was becoming quite distressed at this stage. My sister asked the Ward Manager, "Are we talking about euthanasia? It's illegal in this country you know." The Ward Manager replied, "Goodness, no, of course not." I was upset and said, "Just let her be pain free". [paragraph] The syringe driver was applied and my mother was catheterised to ease the nursing of her. She had not had anything by mouth since midday Monday 17th August 1998. [paragraph] A little later Dr BARTON [sic] appeared and confirmed that a haemetoma [sic] was present and that this was the kindest way to treat my mother. She also stated, "And the next thing will be a chest infection." [In her witness statement Mrs Mackenzie has stated that ' DR BARTON [sic] then said, "Well, of course, the next thing for you to expect is a chest infection"'.][paragraph] I would like to clarify the issue of my 'agreement' to the syringe driver process. It was not a question, in my mind, of 'agreement'. [paragraph] I wanted my mother's pain to be relieved. I did not 'agree' to my mother being simply subjected to a course of pain relief treatment, at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital, which I knew would effectively prevent steps being taken to facilitate her recovery and would result in her death. [paragraph] I also wanted my mother to be transferred back to the Haslar Hospital where she had, on two occasions, undergone operations and recovered well. My mother was not, I knew, terminally ill and, with hindsight, perhaps I should have challenged Dr BARTON [sic] more strongly on this issue. [paragraph] In my severe distress I did not but I do believe that my failure to pursue the point more vigorously should not have prevented Dr BARTON [sic] from initiating an alternative course of action to that which was taken, namely a referral back to the Haslar Hospital where my mother's condition could have been treated and where an offer had already been made to do so. [paragraph] I accept that my mother was unwell and that her physical, reserves had been depleted. However, she had, during the preceding days and weeks, demonstrated great courage and strength. I believe that she should have been given a further chance of recovery especially in the light of the fact that her condition had, it would seem likely, been aggravated by poor quality service and avoidable delay experienced whilst in the hands of those whose responsibly [responsibility] it was to care for her. [paragraph] My mother's bodily strength allowed her to survive a further 4 days using her reserves. She suffered kidney failure on 19th August and no further urine was passed. The same catheter remained in place until

her death. [paragraph] Because the syringe driver was deemed to be essential following the night of several doses of pain relief my mother's condition gradually deteriorated during the next few days, as I knew it inevitably would, and she died on Friday the 21st August 1998.'

- 15.14. It is noted that Mrs LACK had made contemporaneous hand-written notes comprising five numbered pages. In her Witness Statement she records these '... are in the form of a basic chronology and I incorporated within them a series of questions which focused on particular areas of concern in respect of which I sought an explanation or clarification from the hospital authorities. Following presentation of my notes we were visited on the ward by Mrs Sue HUTCHINGS [sic] on 20.8.98.'
- 15.14.1. Mrs LACK also made a further one page of contemporaneous hand-written notes. In these she states she was so appalled about her mother's condition, discomfort and severe pain that she visited Haslar Hospital at about lunchtime on 17th August 1998 to ask questions about her mother's condition before she [Mrs RICHARDS] had left the Haslar Hospital ward for her second transfer to Gosport War Memorial Hospital. She learned that, prior to her discharge from Haslar Hospital on 17th August 1998, her mother had been eating, drinking, using a commode and able to stand if aided. Mrs LACK also states in this contemporaneous record that 'On leaving the ward [at Haslar Hospital at about lunchtime on 17th August 1998] I bumped into the Dr [doctor] who had been in casualty theatre for my mothers [sic] second [sic] operation. He was with consultant when all the procedures were explained to me on Friday 14th [August 1998] He said "How's your mother". I explained the current position to him in detail. I told him that she was in severe pain since the transfer which had been undertaken a short time earlier. He said "We've had no referral. Get them to refer her back. We'll see her."
- 15.15. It is noted that a Discharge Letter from the Royal Hospital Haslar describes Mrs RICHARDS' condition on discharge on 17th August 1998 as "She can, however, mobilise fully weight bearing."
- 15.16. It is also noted that Mrs LACK has stated that she and her sister were constantly at the Gosport War Memorial Hospital, day and night, from 17th August 1998 until the time their mother died.
- 15.16.1. Mrs MACKENZIE has stated that 'I stayed with my mother until very late that Tuesday night [18th August 1998]. it was past midnight, in fact, when my son arrived from London. As from the Wednesday night my sister also sat with me all night long and we both remained, continuously, until twenty past nine on the following Friday evening [21st August 1998] when my mother died. During that time Dr Barton [sic] did not visit my mother. I am quite certain about this because our mother was not left alone, in her room, at

any time apart from when she was washed by the nursing staff. Either my sister or I, [sic] was with her throughout.'

- 15.16.2. Mrs MACKENZIE has also stated that although she did not sign the contemporaneous notes made by Mrs LACK she '... was a party, at times, to the preparation process and where, on occasions, my sister has referred to 'I' in fact it could read 'we' as we were together when certain events occurred.'
- 15.16.3. Mrs MACKENZIE continues 'It seems to me that she [Mrs RICHARDS] must have had considerable reserves of strength to enable her to survive from Monday until Friday, five days, when all she had was a diet of Diamorphine and no hydration whatsoever, apart from porridge, scrambled eggs and a drink, at the Royal Hospital Haslar, before transfer to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital.'

Appendix C

Glossary

Acetabulum is the name given to the two deep socket into which the head of the thigh bone (femur) fits at the hip joint.

ADL [activities of daily living] are those physical activities of daily life necessary for normal human functioning and include getting up, washing, dressing, preparing a simple meal, etc.

Analgesia is the relief of pain. This can be achieved by physical means including warmth and comfortable positioning as well as by the use of drugs. The aim is to keep patients pain free with minimal side effects from medication.

Bronchopneumonia is inflammation of the lung usually caused by bacterial infection. Appropriate antibiotic therapy, based on the clinical situation and on microbiological studies, will result in complete recovery in the majority of patients. It can contribute to the cause of death in moribund patients.

Co-codamol is a drug mixture consisting of paracetamol and codeine phosphate, which is used for the relief of mild to moderate pain.

Cyclizine is a drug used to prevent nausea and vomiting, vertigo, and motion sickness.

Dementia is the name given to a condition associated with the acquired loss of intellect, memory, and social functioning.

Diamorphine, also known as heroin, is a powerful opioid analgesic.

Haematoma is an accumulation of blood within the tissues, which clots to form a solid swelling.

Haloperidol, a drug used in the treatment of psychoses including schizophrenia and mania and also for the short-term management of agitation, excitement, and violent or dangerously impulsive behaviour. Dosage for all indications should be individually determined and it is best initiated and titrated under close clinical supervision. For patients who are elderly the normal starting dose should be halved, followed by a gradual titration to achieve optimal response. It is not licensed for subcutaneous administration (see **licensed** below).

Hemiarthroplasty is the surgical remodelling of a part of the hip joint whereby the bone end of the femur is replaced by a metal or plastic device to create a functioning joint.

Hyoscine is a drug used to reduce secretions and it also provides a degree of amnesia and sedation, and has an anti-vomiting effect. Its side effects include drowsiness.

Lactulose is a preparation taken by mouth to relieve constipation.

A **microgram** is one millionth of a gram and is not to be confused with a milligram dosage of a drug, which is one thousand times larger.

Midazolam is a sedative drug about which there have been reports of respiratory depression. It has to be used with caution in elderly people. It is used for intravenous sedative cover for minor surgical procedures. It is also used for sedation by intravenous injection in critically ill patients in intensive care. It can be given intramuscularly. In the management of overdose special attention should be paid to the respiratory and cardiovascular functions in intensive care. It is not licensed for subcutaneous administration (see **licensed** above).

Morphine is an opioid analgesic used to relieve severe pain.

Oramorph is a drug used in the treatment of chronic pain. It contains morphine and is in the form of a liquid. 10mls of Oramorph at a strength of 10mgs of morphine sulphate in 5mls of liquid is an appropriate first dose to give to a person in severe pain, which had not responded to other less potent, pain relieving drugs.

Respiratory depression is the impairment of breathing by drugs or mechanical means which leads to asphyxia and, if uncorrected, to death.

Subcutaneous means beneath the skin.

A **syringe driver** is a power driven device for pushing the plunger of a syringe forward at an accurately controlled rate. It is an aid to administering medicinal preparations in liquid form over much longer periods than could be achieved by injecting by hand. In this case the syringe driver used was a Sims Graseby MS 26 Daily rate syringe driver which operates over periods of 24-hours.

Tradazone is a drug used in the treatment of depressive illness, particularly when sedation is required.

Unlicensed medicines. In order to ensure that medicines are safe, effective and of suitable quality, they must have a product licence (now called a market authorisation) before being marketed in the United Kingdom. Unlicensed drugs are not licensed for use for any indication or age group. Licensing arrangements constrain pharmaceutical companies but not prescribers. The Medicines Act 1968 and European legislation make provision for doctors to use unlicensed medicines. Individual prescribers of unlicensed medicines, however, are always responsible for ensuring that there is adequate information to support the quality, efficacy, safety and intended use of a drug before using it.

A **Zimmer frame** is a lightweight, but sturdy, frame the patient can use for support to assist safe walking.

APPENDIX D

Texts used for reference have included:

1. Adam J. ABC of palliative care: The last 48 hours. *British Medical Journal* 1997; 315: 1600-1603.
 - 1.1. This paper is from the widely read, British Medical Journal which is published weekly and received by about 30,000 general practitioners and 45,000 hospital doctors in England and Wales. It records that treatment with opioids (viz. morphine and diamorphine) should be individually tailored, the effect reviewed, and the dose titrated accordingly.
2. *ABPI Compendium of data sheets and summaries of product characteristics 1998-99: with the code of practice for the Pharmaceutical Industry*. Datapharm Publications Limited, 12 Whitehall, London SW1A 2DY.
3. Breggin P R. *Toxic psychiatry. Drugs and electroconvulsive therapy: the truth and the better alternatives*. 1993. HarperCollins Publishers. London. pp. 578.
4. British Medical Association and the Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain. *British National Formulary*. Number 32 (September 1996). The Pharmaceutical Press. Oxford.

5. *Cecil Textbook of Medicine*. eds. J.C. Bennett & F. Plum. W.B. Saunders Co. 20th Edition. 1996.
6. Letter from Clive Ward-Able (Medical and Healthcare Director) and Lee Neubauer BSc (Hons) (New Product Specialist), Roche Pharmaceuticals.
 - 6.1. A copy of this letter has already been supplied to the Police and reports that the product licence does not cover the administration of Hypnovel® (midazolam) by subcutaneous injection.
7. Roche Pharmaceuticals. Hypnovel® [midazolam]. Summary of product characteristics.
8. Letter from Dr R J Donnelly, Medical Director of Janssen-Cilag Ltd.
 - 8.1. A copy of this letter has already been supplied to the Police and reports that Haldol™ decanoate (haloperidol) is not licensed for subcutaneous use.
9. Letter from Miss Jo Medlock, Manager of Medical Information and Pharmacovigilance, Norton Pharmaceuticals.
 - 9.1. A copy of this letter has already been supplied to the Police and reports that Serenace™ (haloperidol) ampoules are not licensed for subcutaneous administration.
10. MeReC. Pain control in palliative care. *MeReC Bulletin National Prescribing Centre*. 1996; 7 (7); 25-28.
 - 10.1. MeReC is the abbreviation for the 'Medicines Resource Centre'. This bulletin is sent free to all general practitioners in England and Wales and also to NHS Hospital and Community Pharmacists. The list of those who receive this bulletin is updated every few weeks.
11. Sims Graseby Limited. *MS 16A Syringe Driver. MS 26 Syringe Driver: Instruction manual*. Sims Graseby Limited. 1998.

Appendix E

The writer's qualifications and experience including the management of dying patients

I, Brian Livesley, qualified MB, ChB (Leeds) in 1960.
My principal additional qualifications are MD (London) 1979, FRCP (London) 1989.

From 1961-69, I held a series of clinical training and teaching posts through all hospital medical grades to senior medical registrar level at University and District Hospitals in Leeds, Manchester and Liverpool in which I gained a wide range of general medical expertise.

At the beginning of my medical career during 1961, I was also trained in the management of diabetic patients in Leeds by Professor (later Sir) Ronald Tunbridge. For five years (1963-67), I held a regular weekly diabetic out-patient clinic in Manchester (two diabetic clinics each week during 1963-65) being also responsible for the acute and follow-up management of newly presenting diabetic patients as well as having a full range of general medical experience.

For four years (1969-72), I was Harvey Research Fellow in cardiology at King's College Hospital, London, where I developed original research in electrocardiographic, cardiac pacing, and metabolic techniques for the study of ischaemic heart disease. This also involved extensive follow-up studies over a period of more than six years. The several and separate aspects of this work were published in internationally reputable professional journals and now form part of the corpus of present day knowledge in cardiology. My continuing interest in this area led me to specialise in geriatric medicine with some emphasis on cardiology in elderly people.

I have been a consultant physician since 1973 and am entered in the General Medical Council's Principal List as a specialist in both General Medicine and Geriatric Medicine.

In 1987, I was appointed against open competition to a Foundation Chair as the University of London's Professor in the Care of the Elderly based at Charing Cross and Westminster Medical School (now the Imperial College School of Medicine) and as Honorary Consultant Physician.

I am in active clinical practice at the Chelsea & Westminster Hospital, London, where I head up a busy clinical department consisting of three consultant-led medical teams. These are all routinely involved in the emergency medical admissions and follow-up management of adults of all ages including those with diabetes mellitus, cardiac, respiratory, and skeletal diseases. During the last two years I have developed one other team that is providing a palliative care service for non-cancer patients.

Since 1969 I have taught not only undergraduate and postgraduate medical students, but also by invitation have lectured (throughout the United Kingdom, Europe, and elsewhere) to a wide range of other groups—professional and lay. I have also initiated and led courses teaching and appraising senior medical teachers. For fifteen years (1980-94), I served as a clinical examiner for the Final MB degree at the University of London—latterly (1990-94) as a senior clinical examiner. For six years (1987-93), I also examined in Medicine for the Worshipful Society of Apothecaries of London. For seven years (1986-93), I was Royal College of Physicians of London Examiner for the Diploma of Geriatric Medicine; and, for two years (1994-96) was an appointed Member of the United Examining Board for England and Scotland. In addition, I have examined externally for the degrees of BPharm and PhD. During 1998, 1999, & 2000 I have been an invited external clinical examiner for the Final MB degree at the Royal Free and

University College London Medical School where by recent invitation I will examine the candidates being considered for a Distinction in 2001.

In 1991, by invitation, I addressed a House of Lords group on issues relating to the clinical management of elderly people.

In 1992, I was one of a team at the Royal College of Physicians who contributed to the College's publication entitled, 'High quality long-term care for elderly people.'

From 1983-1995 I was a Justice of the Peace for the SE London Commission of the Peace having to stand down following a invitation in 1995 to head up a comprehensive review of the care provided in a 150-bedded nursing home. In 1996 all 16 recommendations in the resulting 40,000-word report were accepted and acted upon by the commissioning Health Agency (1). Also in 1996, I gave invited evidence on this topic to a Health Committee in the House of Commons (2).

In 1999 and again in 2000, the King's Fund in London identified the work in my clinical department as a national model for the care of elderly people.

In July 2000, I was the only clinician to give a presentation by invitation at a meeting on "Emerging Intermediate Care Strategy — 'Leading edge' Practice" held at the Royal College of Surgeons of England, London. This was well received and repeated by invitation in the North of England in November 2000.

During 1999 and 2000 I was working with the British Medical Association's Ethics department on the topics of 'dying as a diagnosis' and 'the appropriate care of the dying'. In addition, I have recently chaired a medico-legal group within my NHS Hospital Trust and produced a report on 'Guidelines for the artificial nutrition of patients affected by strokes'. My clinical, teaching, and research work on the management of dying patients extends over the last twenty five years and I was a leader of the concept that 'dying should be a recognised diagnosis' to allow for the appropriate palliative care of patients dying from non-cancer conditions. More recently I have established an original palliative care service for non-cancer patients in my own department at the Chelsea & Westminster hospital where we are pursuing research in this topic.

My over 120 publications include several monographs, many peer-reviewed research investigations into clinical, scientific, social, historical, and educational problems of medicine in our ageing society, editorials and leading articles by invitation of professional journals, and, in addition by invitation, more than 100 standard and extended book reviews. My peer-reviewed publications also include those on the clinical management of dying patients.

References as numbered above:

1. Livesley B, Ellington S. Report on the independent comprehensive review of the care of elderly people at St. Christopher's Nursing Home, Hatfield. East and North Hertfordshire Health Authority, 1996. (by invitation)

2. Livesley B. Memorandum of recommendations and evidence submitted to the Health Committee on long-term care provision and funding. Volume II; pp. 114-22. London: HMSO, 1996. (by invitation)

signed
BRIAN LIVESLEY

date 10th July 2001