TABLE OF CASES

1		Negligence	Causation	Conclusion
Elsie Devine	Renal failure	Wilcock: excessive doses of	Wilcock: possible entered	No negligence
		diamorphine	terminal phase naturally	No causation
		Black: palliative care	Black: entered terminal	No gross negligence
		appropriate	phase naturally	
			Dudley: entered terminal	
			phase naturally	
Leslie Pittock	Bronchopneumonia and	Wilcock: excessive doses	Wilcock: No doubt entered	No negligence
	other conditions (admitted	Black: excessive doses, but	terminal phase naturally;	No causation
	for terminal care)	allowed to die peacefully	can't exclude possibility life	No gross negligence
			shortened by medication	
			Black: No doubt entered	
			terminal phase naturally;	
			drugs may have shortened	
			life by hours/days, but could	
			not be proved	
Elsie Lavender	Spinal cord injury	Wilcock: excessive doses	Wilcock: possible entered	Possible negligence
		other conditions (admitted for terminal care)	Leslie Pittock Bronchopneumonia and other conditions (admitted for terminal care) Wilcock: excessive doses Black: excessive doses, but allowed to die peacefully	diamorphine Black: palliative care appropriate Black: entered terminal phase naturally Dudley: entered terminal phase naturally Dudley: entered terminal phase naturally Elsile Pittock Bronchopneumonia and other conditions (admitted for terminal care) Black: excessive doses Black: excessive doses, but allowed to die peacefully allowed to die peacefully Can't exclude possibility life shortened by medication Black: No doubt entered terminal phase naturally; drugs may have shortened life by hours/days, but could not be proved

			Black: excessive doses	terminal phase naturally;	No causation
			Black, excessive doses		
				drugs shortened life	No gross negligence (n.b.
				Black: little doubt entered	Black's comments re 'very
				terminal phase before	complex problem in geriatric
				syringe driver commenced;	medicine'
				drugs may have shortened	
				life in minor fashion	
4	Arthur Cunningham	Bronchopneumonia	Wilcock: doses appropriate	Wilcock: naturally entered	No negligence
			Black: some doses excessive	terminal phase	No causation
				Black: naturally entered	No gross negligence
				terminal phase; could not	
				prove drugs shortened life	
5	Ruby Lake	Fracture of neck/	Wilcock: syringe driver not	Wilcock: may have entered	No negligence
		bronchopneumonia	appropriate; doses excessive	terminal phase naturally	No causation
			Black: syringe driver	Black: could not be proved	No gross negligence
			probably reasonable	drugs shortened life	
6	Enid Spurgin	Fracture of hip/infection	Wilcock: excessive doses	Wilcock: potentially	Possible negligence
			Black: syringe driver	reversible; drugs would have	No causation
			appropriate; excessive dose	contributed to death	No gross negligence
				Black: no doubt dying;	
				cannot be proved drugs	
				shortened life by more than	
				hours	

Robert Wilson	Fracture of arm; heart, liver	Wilcock: excessive doses	Wilcock: death in keeping	Negligence
	and renal failure	Black: excessive doses	with natural causes and can't	No causation
		Baker: excessive doses	say with certainty drugs	No gross negligence
		Marshall: excessive doses	contributed	
			Black: death almost	
			certainly result of drugs	
			Baker: death hastened by	
			morphine and may well have	
			been initiated by same	
			Marshall: morphine likely to	
			have hastened death	
Geoffrey Packman	GI bleed	Wilcock: failure to transfer;	Wilcock: potentially	No negligence
		doses excessive	reversible condition; drugs	No causation
		Black: palliative care	contributed to death	No gross negligence
		appropriate (range of	Black: died of natural	
		reasonable clinical	causes; drugs made very	
		decisions); doses not	little difference	
		excessive		
Sheila Gregory				
Helena Service				
	Geoffrey Packman Sheila Gregory	Geoffrey Packman GI bleed Sheila Gregory	and renal failure Black: excessive doses Baker: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses	and renal failure Black: excessive doses Baker: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Marshall: excessive doses Black: death almost certainty result of drugs Baker: death hastened by morphine and may well have been initiated by same Marshall: morphine likely to have hastened death Wilcock: failure to transfer; doses excessive Black: palliative care appropriate (range of reasonable clinical decisions); doses not excessive Sheila Gregory With natural causes and can't with natural causes and can't with natural causes and can't say with certainty drugs contributed With natural causes and can't say with certainty drugs contributed Black: death almost certainty result of drugs Baker: death hastened by morphine and may well have been initiated by same Marshall: morphine likely to have hastened death Black: potentially reversible condition; drugs contributed to death Black: died of natural causes; drugs made very little difference