

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

## **SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS**

Ruby Lake an 84-year-old lady with a number of chronic diseases, suffers a fall and a fractured neck of femur in August 1998. She is admitted to hospital and has operative treatment but develops post-operative complications including chest infection, chest pain and confusion at night and subsequently deteriorates and dies in the Gosport War Memorial Hospital.

In my view a major problem in assessing this case is the poor documentation in Gosport Hospital in both the medical and nursing notes, making a retrospective assessment of her progress difficult. Good Medical Practice (GMC 2001) states that “good clinical care must include adequate assessment of the patient’s condition, based on the history and symptoms and if necessary, an appropriate examination”..... “in providing care you must keep clear, accurate, legible and contemporaneous patient records which report the relevant clinical findings, the decisions made, the information given to patients and any drugs or other treatments prescribed”.... “good clinical care must include – taking suitable prompt action where necessary”.... “prescribe drugs and treatments, including repeat prescriptions only when you have adequate knowledge of the patient’s health and medical needs”. The lack of detail in particular in the medical notes, the lack of recording of why decisions were made or if the patient was properly examined represent poor clinical practice to the standard set by the General Medical Council.

In my view the combination of a lack of a documented clinical examination, the lack of prescription of appropriate oral analgesia on admission to Gosport, the decision to start a syringe driver without documentation of a clinical diagnosis or the reason for it in the medical notes, together represent a negligent standard of medical care.

Without a proven diagnosis, it is possible that the combination of Diamorphine and Midazolam together with the Hyoscine in a syringe driver contributed in part to Mrs Lake’s death. However, I am unable to satisfy myself to the standard of beyond reasonable doubt that it made more than a minimal contribution.

## **1. INSTRUCTIONS**

To examine the medical records and comment upon the standard of care afforded to the patient in the days leading up to her death against the acceptable standard of the day. Where appropriate, if the care is felt to be sub-optimal, comment upon the extent to which it may or may not disclose criminally culpable actions on the part of individuals or groups.

## **2. ISSUES**

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

- 2.1. Was the standard of care afforded to this patient in the days leading up to her death in keeping with the acceptable standard of the day.
- 2.2. If the care is found to be suboptimal what treatment should normally have been proffered in this case.
- 2.3. If the care is found to be suboptimal to what extent may it disclose criminally culpable actions on the part of individuals or groups.

### 3. CURRICULUM VITAE

Name David Andrew Black

Address Code A

Telephone Code A E-mail: Code A

DOB Code A

Place Windsor, England.

Marital status Married with 2 children.

GMC Full registration. No: Code A

Defence Union Medical Defence Union. No: Code A

**EDUCATION**

Leighton Park School, Reading, Berks.	1969-1973
St John's College, Cambridge University.	1974-1977
St Thomas' Hospital, London SE1	1977-1980

#### DEGREES AND QUALIFICATIONS

BA, Cambridge University (Upper Second in Medical Sciences)	1977
MB BChir, Cambridge University	1980
MA, Cambridge University	1981
MRCP (UK)	1983
Accreditation in General (internal) Medicine and Geriatric Medicine	1989
FRCP	1994

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

MBA (Distinction) University of Hull.	1997
Certificate in Teaching	2001
NHS/INSEAD Clinical strategists program	2003

#### **SPECIALIST SOCIETIES**

British Geriatrics Society  
 British Society of Gastroenterology  
 British Association of Medical Managers

#### **PRESENT POST**

Dean Director of Postgraduate Medical and Dental Education Kent, Surrey and Sussex Deanery.	2004-present
Consultant Physician (Geriatric Medicine) Queen Mary's Hospital, Sidcup, Kent.	1987-present
Associate member General Medical Council	2002-present

#### **PREVIOUS POSTS**

Associate Dean. London Deanery.	2004
Medical Director (part time) Queen Mary's Hospital	1997-2003
Operations Manager (part time) Queen Mary's Hospital, Sidcup, Kent	1996-1997
Senior Registrar in General and Geriatric Medicine Guy's Hospital London and St Helen's Hospital Hastings.	1985-1987
Registrar in General Medicine and Gastroenterology St Thomas' Hospital, London.	1984-1985
Registrar in General Medicine Medway Hospital, Gillingham, Kent	1983-1984
SHO rotation in General Medicine	

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Kent & Canterbury Hospital, Canterbury	1982-1983
SHO in General Medicine	
Kent & Sussex Hospital, Tunbridge Wells	1981-1982
House Physician, St Thomas' Hospital	1981
House Surgeon, St Mary's Portsmouth	1980

## PUBLICATIONS

Acute Extrapramidal Reaction to Nomifensine

DA Black, IM O'Brien

Br Med J, 1984; 289; 1272

Transit Time in Ulcerative Proctitis

DA Black, CC Ainley, A Senapati, RPH Thompson

Scand J Gastro, 1987; 22; 872-876.

Lingual Myoclonus and Dislocated Jaw

DA Black, S Das

Br Med J, 1986; 292; 1429

Endoscopic Sclerotherapy for Bleeding Oesophageal Varices in the Elderly

DA Black, RPH Thompson

J Clin and Exper Gerontol, 1987; 9: 131-138

Mental State and Presentation of Myocardial Infarction in the Elderly

DA Black

Age and Ageing, 1987; 16; 125-127

Hyperbilirubinaemia in the Elderly

DA Black, I Sturgess

J Clin and Expt Geront, 1987, 9, 271-284

Malabsorption: Common Causes and their Practical Diagnosis

DA Black

Geriatrics 1988, 43, 65-67

Pseudotumour Cerebri in a patient with Castleman's Disease

DA Black, I Forgacs, DR Davies, RPH Thompson

Postgrad Med J, 1988; 64; 217-219

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Non-Surgical Intervention; A First Choice in obstructive Jaundice

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine, 1988; 18(4); 15-16

Endoscopy: Investigation of choice for many Elderly GI Problems

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine, 1988; 18(9); 14-16

Hepatic Stores of Retinol and Retinyl Esters in Elderly People

DA Black, E Heduan and WD Mitchell

Age and Ageing, 1988; 17; 337-342

Elderly People with low B12 Levels do need Treatment

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine 1989, 19(1); 21-22

NSAIDS and Ulcer disease in Old Age

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine (special supplement) April 1989; 4-5, 8-11

The Independent Living Fund

DA Black

Br Med J (editorial) 1989, 298; 1540

Ischaemic Hepatitis

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine, 1989, 19(9); 92

Laparoscopic cholecystectomy: not without pitfalls in the elderly

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine 1991 21(10); 21

The successful medical management of gastric outflow obstruction associated with the use of non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs in the elderly

RJ Geraghty, DA Black and SA Bruce

Postgrad Med J 1991; 67; 1004-1007

Bronchodilator response to nebulized salbutamol in elderly patients with stable chronic airflow limitation

RJ Geraghty, C Foster, DA Black & S Roe

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Respiratory Medicine 1993 23(5); 46-57

The reality of community care: a geriatricians viewpoint

DA Black

In: Care of elderly people. South East Institute of Public Health 1993; 81-89

Accidents: a geriatrician's viewpoint

DA Black

In: Care of elderly people. South Thames Institute of Public Health. 1994; 53-58.

Community Care Outcomes

DA Black

Br J of Clin Pract 1995 49(1); 19-21

Choice and Opportunity

DA Black

Geriatric Medicine 1996 26(12) 7.

Emergency Day Hospital Assessments

DA Black

Clinical Rehabilitation. 1997; 11(4); 344-347

Geriatric Day Hospital. A future?

DA Black

Opinion in General and Geriatric Medicine. 1997, 1.1, 4-6.

The Health Advisory Service

DA Black

JAGS 1997; 45; 624-625.

The Rhetoric and Reality of Current Management Training for NHS Clinical  
Directors

DA Black

MBA dissertation. 1997. University of Hull.

Community Institutional Medical Care- for the frail elderly.

DA Black & CE Bowman

Br Med J. (Editorial). 1997, 315; 441-442.

Remains of the day.

DA Black

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Health Services Journal. 1998. 19 Feb. p32.

Nutritional problems in old age

DA Black

Opinion in General and Elderly Medicine. 1998. 2(1): 12-13.

Constipation in the elderly :causes and treatments.

DA Black

Prescriber. 1998; 9(19); 105-108.

Intermediate not Indeterminate Care

CE Bowman & DA Black

Hospital Medicine. 1998; 58; 877-9

Improving geriatric services

DA Black

JRColl Physicians Lond 1999; 33: 113. (also p152)

General internal medicine and speciality medicine- time to rethink the relationship.

JM Rhodes, B Harrison, D Black et al.

JR Coll Physicians Lond 1999, 33: 341-347.

Iron deficiency in old age

DA Black & CM Fraser.

British Journal of General Practice. 1999; 49; 729-730

A systems approach to elderly care

DA Black, C Bowman, M Severs.

Br J Health Care Management, 2000, 6(2), 49-52

The Modern Geriatric Day Hospital

DA Black.

Hospital Medicine. 2000.61(8);539-543

Complaints, Doctors and Older People

DA Black

Age and Ageing. 2000; 29(5):389-391.

NSF Overview

DA Black

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Geriatric Medicine 2001; 31(4):11-17 & 31(5)

Anaemia

D Sulch, DA Black

Geriatric Medicine 2001; 31(6): 46-49

Professional Review Mechanism. Chapter in: Clinical Governance Day to Day.

DA Black.

British Association of Medical Managers 2002; 41-56.

Induction for newly appointed consultants

DA Black

Clinician in Management. 2002; 11(1); 9-13

Average length of stay, delayed discharge and hospital congestion.

DA Black and M Pearson

BMJ 2002;325:610-611

An audit of outcomes in day hospital based crisis interventions.

David A Black

Age Ageing 2003; 32; 360-361

Quality Improvement in the UK

DA Black

Chapter 119 In: Brocklehurst's Textbook of Geriatric Medicine. 6<sup>th</sup> Edition Ed: Tallis and Fillit. 2003.

The new NHS framework for handling performance concerns.

David A Black

Hospital Medicine 2004; 65 (2): 112-115

Not because they are old- revisited

DA Black

Age and Ageing. 2004;33; 430-432

## **BOOK**

British Geriatrics Society compendium of policy statements and statements of good practice. Edited by DA Black & A Main. First Edition. 1995.



Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

## RECENT SIGNIFICANT PRESENTATIONS

Secondary care as part of the whole system. Laing & Buisson conference on intermediate care. April 2001

The impact of the NSF on everyday Clinical Care. Conference on Clinical governance in elderly care . RCP May 2001

The Geriatricians view of the NSF. BGS Autumn Meeting 2001

The Organisation of Stroke Care. Physicians and managers working together to develop services. Professional training and clinical governance in geriatric medicine. All at Argentinean Gerontological Society 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary meeting. Nov 2001

The future of Geriatric Medicine in the UK. Workshop: American Geriatrics Society May 2002

Liberating Front Line Leaders. Workshop: BMM Annual Meeting June 2002

Revalidation - the State of Play. A Survival Guide for Physicians. Mainz July 2002

Medical Aspects of Intermediate Care. London Conference on building intermediate care services for the future. Sept 2002

Developing Consultant Careers. Workshop: BMM Medical Directors Meeting. Nov 2002

Lang and Buisson. Update on Intermediate Care Dec 2002

Intermediate Care Update: London National Elderly Care Conference. June 2003.

Appraisal- an update. GMC symposium on revalidation. Brighton. June 2003.

Innovations in emergency care for older people. HSJ Conference. London July 2003.

Emergency Care & Older People: separate elderly teams? RCP London March 2004

Professional Performance & New Consultants. London Deanery Conference April 2004

Mentoring as part of induction for new consultants. Mentoring in Medicine Conference. Nottingham. April 2004

The Future of Chronic Care- Where, How and Who? CEO & MD conference. RCP London. June 2004

Mentoring as part of consultant induction. Surviving to Thriving. New Consultant Conference, London June 2004

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

360 Degree Appraisal. Chairman National Conference. Nottingham June 2004  
 Maintaining Professional Performance. BAMM Annual Summer School. June 2004  
 Chronic Disease management. BGS Council Study Day. Basingstoke. July 2004  
 MMC post FP2. BGS Study Day. Basingstoke. July 2004  
 Designing care for older peoples. Emergency services conference. London July 2004.  
 The Modern Geriatric Day Hospital. Multidisciplinary Day. South East Kent hospitals.  
 Sept 2004  
 Geriatricians and Acute General Medicine. BGS Autumn Meeting . Harrogate Oct  
 2004

#### **4. DOCUMENTATION**

This Report is based on the following documents:

- [1] Full paper set of medical records of Ruby Lake (BJC/67)
- [2] Operation Rochester Briefing Document Criminal Investigation Summary.
- [3] Hampshire Constabulary Operation Rochester Guidance for Medical Experts.
- [4] Commission for Health Improvement Investigation Report on  
 Portsmouth Health Care NHS Trust at Gosport War Memorial Hospital  
 (July 2002).
- [5] Palliative Care Handbook Guidelines on Clinical  
 Management, Third Edition, Salisbury Palliative Care Services (1995);  
 Also referred to as the 'Wessex Protocols.'

**5 CHRONOLOGY/CASE ABSTRACT.** (The numbers in brackets refer to the page of evidence, the numbers with 'H' in front are the Haslar notes).

- 5.1. Ruby Lake an 84-year-old lady in 1998, was admitted as an emergency on 5<sup>th</sup> August 1998 to the Haslar Hospital (H52).

## Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

- 5.2. In 1982 she had been diagnosed with osteoarthritis (211). In 1989 she was noted to have varicose leg ulcers (73) and in 1990 was documented as having gross lipodermatus sclerosis (239). In 1993 she had problems with left ventricular failure, atrial fibrillation, aortic sclerosis and during that admission had a bout of acute renal failure with her urea rising to 25.7 (60). Her Barthel was 18 in 1993 (179).
- 5.3. In 1995 she was admitted with an acute arthritis and was noted to have a positive rheumatoid factor (30) and a positive ANF. She had mild chronic renal failure, which was noted to be worse when using non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs (31) her creatinine rose to 178 when Brufen was introduced (69). Her mental test score was 10/10 (70) but she did have some mobility problems and was seen by an Occupational Therapist and a Physiotherapist (93) (164).
- 5.4. In 1997 she was under the care of the Dermatologist with considerable problems from her leg ulcers and she was now having pain at night and was using regular Co proxamol (239). In 1998 she was seen by a Rheumatologist who thought she had CREST syndrome including leg ulcers, calcinosis, telangiectasia, and osteoarthritis, (353).
- 5.5. On 29<sup>th</sup> June 1998 she was admitted to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital under the care of her GP Dr North (300). The medical clerking is virtually non-existent (75), simply saying that she was admitted for her leg ulcer treatment and her pulse, blood pressure and temperature being recorded. It was noted that she was having continual pain and Tramadol 50 mgs at night was added to her regular 3 times a day Co proxamol. (197) She was seen by a Consultant Dermatologist during this admission (76).
- 5.6. The nursing cardex showed that she was continent with no confusion (298) however; she was sleeping downstairs (299). Her Barthel was 12 (314) and her Waterlow pressure score was 16 (high risk). She appears to have been discharged home.
- 5.7. She was admitted to the Haslar Hospital on 5<sup>th</sup> August having fallen and sustained a fractured neck of femur. This is operated upon successfully. By the 8<sup>th</sup> she is noted to be short of breath and probably in left ventricular failure with fluid overload (H63). Her renal function has deteriorated from a urea of 16 and a creatinine of 119 on admission (H9) to a urea of 25 and a creatinine of 127 (H68) by the

## Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

- 10<sup>th</sup>. Certainly on the 10<sup>th</sup> she appear unwell (H17) and it was not clear if this was a possible myocardial infarction or a chest infection (H17). However a chest x-ray is thought to show a chest infection and she is treated with regular Augmentin, an antibiotic (H69). On 11<sup>th</sup> her white count is significantly raised at 18.8 (H96). She has a mild anaemia post operatively of 10.5 (H92) her haemoglobin was normal on admission at 13.1 (H16).
- 5.8. On 13<sup>th</sup> August she is found to be brighter and sitting out and walking short distances with frame (H18) and this functional improvement continues, documented in the notes up to 17<sup>th</sup> August (H18). However, she is noted to have had an episode of chest pain on 15<sup>th</sup> August (H75). There is no doubt that her ECG changes between her admission ECG (H86) and the ECG(s) on 13<sup>th</sup> August and 15<sup>th</sup> August (H80 and H78). This is not commented on in the notes.
- 5.9. The nursing cardex shows that she is unsettled most nights, for example, 10/8 (H166), 13/8 (H168), 16/8 (H170) and on the night before discharge from Haslar on 17<sup>th</sup> August she “settled late after frequent calling out”. The nursing notes also show that she had a continuing niggling pyrexial and was still significantly pyrexial the day before discharge (H137). It also documents that on the day of discharge, she has increased shortness of breath and oxygen is restarted (H171).
- 5.10. Her drug chart shows that she receives low molecular weight Heparin as a prophylaxis against deep venous thrombosis (Calciparine) from admission until discharge. Diamorphine 2.5 mgs IV is giving as a single dose on 5<sup>th</sup> August (H128). Co-proxamol is given from 5<sup>th</sup> – 8<sup>th</sup> August (H128) and then replaced by Paracetamol written up on the ‘as required’ part of the drug chart, which she receives almost every day, up to and including the day she is discharged 18<sup>th</sup> August (H175). The discharge letter mentions her regular drugs of Allopurinol, Bumetanide, Digoxin and Slow K, but does not mention the analgesia (H44).
- 5.11. She is seen by Dr Lord on 14<sup>th</sup> August (25-26). She notes that Mrs Lake’s appetite is poor, is in atrial fibrillation and may have Sick Sinus Syndrome ( an irregularity of cardiac rhythm). She has been dehydrated, hypokalaemic, and has a normochromic anaemia. She notes her leg ulcers and her pressure sores. She agrees to transfer her to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital and is uncertain as to

## Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

whether there will be significant improvement.

- 5.12. She is admitted to Dryad Ward on 18<sup>th</sup> August (77) and the medical notes states that she had a fractured neck of femur and a past medical history of angina and congestive cardiac failure. The rest of the medical notes, note that she is continent, transfers with two, needs help with ADL's, a Barthel of 6. The management plan is "get to know, gentle rehabilitation". The next line states "I am happy for the nursing staff to confirm death". The next and final line in the medical notes (77) is a nursing note from 21<sup>st</sup> August that Mrs Lake had died peacefully at 18.25 hrs.
- 5.13. The nursing care plan, on admission, noted her pressure sores (375), her leg ulcer care (377) and notes that she communicates well (387) but does have some pain (387).
- 5.14. On 18<sup>th</sup> August the nursing continuation notes state that she awoke distressed and anxious and was given Oramorphine (388), it states that she was very anxious and confused at times. On 19<sup>th</sup> August it said that she was comfortable at night, settled well, drowsy but rousable. Syringe driver satisfactory. On 20<sup>th</sup> August it stated continued to deteriorate. The nursing summary (394) states on 18<sup>th</sup> August, pleasant lady, happy to be here. On 19<sup>th</sup> August at 11.50 am she complains of chest pain and looks "grey around mouth". Oramorphine is given. She is noted to be very anxious and the doctor is notified. The pain is apparently only relieved for short period and she is commenced on a syringe drive.
- On 20<sup>th</sup> August she continued to deteriorate overnight, the family have been informed and "very bubbly". On 21<sup>st</sup> August she deteriorates slowly.
- 5.15. Drug Chart Review: Admission on 18<sup>th</sup> August, Digoxin, Slow K, Bumetanide and Allopurinol are written up as per the discharge note from Haslar (369). On the 'as required' part of the drug chart (369) Oramorphine 10 mgs in 5 mls, 2.5 – 5 mgs is written up together with Temazepam. No Temazepam is given but 3 doses of Oramorph are given, one on the 18<sup>th</sup> August and two doses on 19<sup>th</sup> August.
- 5.16. On 19<sup>th</sup> August (368) Diamorphine 20 – 200 mgs sub cut in 24 hours is written up 20 mgs is started on 19<sup>th</sup> August, 20 mgs is started on 20<sup>th</sup> August, then discarded, and 40 mgs started, on 21<sup>st</sup> August 60

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

mgs is started. Hyoscine 200-800 micrograms subcut in 24 hours is also prescribed on 19<sup>th</sup> August. 400 micrograms is started on 20<sup>th</sup> August and replaced later in the day by 800 micrograms, which is continued on 21<sup>st</sup> August. Midazolam 20 – 80 mgs subcut in 24 hours is written up and 20 mgs prescribed on 20<sup>th</sup> August, replaced later in the day by 40 mgs and finally by 60 mgs on 21<sup>st</sup> August.

## 6. TECHNICAL BACKGROUND / EXAMINATION OF THE FACTS IN ISSUE

- 6.1. This section will consider whether there were any actions so serious that they might amount to gross negligence or any unlawful acts, or deliberate unlawful killing in the care of Ruby Lake. Also whether there were any actions or omissions by the medical team, nursing staff or attendant GP's that contributed to the demise of Ruby Lake, in particular, whether beyond reasonable doubt, the actions or omissions more than minimally, negligibly or trivially contributed to death.
- 6.2. Mrs Lake had a number of chronic diseases prior to her terminal admission following a fractured neck of femur. She had cardiac disease with known atrial fibrillation, aortic sclerosis and heart failure, documented in 1993. She also had not just osteoarthritis but an auto-immune arthritis that was thought variously to be either rheumatoid arthritis or variant auto-immune arthritis (the CREST syndrome). She also had problems as a result of her long-standing varicose swelling of her lower limbs, with many years of unresolved and very painful leg ulcers. Finally she had impaired renal function, developed mild acute renal failure when she was given on occasion, non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs.
- 6.3. She is admitted by her GP into a GP bed consultant ward in June 1998. Beyond measuring her blood pressure, there is no medical clerking and the medical notes are rudimentary at best. Significant information is available from the nursing cardex, which confirms that she is continent and there is no confusion. However, she does have some dependency with a Barthel of 12. Her pain relief is increased by adding Tramadol (an oral opiate like drug) to her Co proxamol and she is able to be discharged home, having been seen by the Dermatologist.
- 6.4. As is all too common, she subsequently has a fall and suffers a fractured neck of femur. She is admitted to the Haslar Hospital for operative repair. There is always a very significant mortality and morbidity after fractured neck of femurs in old people, particularly in those who have previous cardiac and other chronic diseases.

## Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

- 6.5. She is clearly unwell on 10<sup>th</sup> August, this is thought to have probably have been a chest infection and she is treated appropriately with antibiotics. However, her pyrexia never actually settles prior to discharge. She also suffers from at least one other episode of chest pain; again no diagnosis is come to in the medical notes, although her ECGs do appear to have changed during her admission, suggesting that this was either coronary event, including a possible heart attack or even a possible pulmonary embolus, despite her prophylactic anti-DVT therapy.
- 6.6. She is documented to be confused on many evenings, including the evening before transfer from Haslar to Gosport War Memorial Hospital. There may be multiple reasons for this, simply having an operation after a fractured neck of femur can cause acute confusion which is more obvious in the evenings. Chest infections and cardiac events can also cause acute confusion. She was on regular oral Co proxamol and Tramadol prior to her admission. The Tramadol was not continued and the Co proxamol was replaced after a few days with Paracetamol which she does receive on a regular basis for pain, although it is not clear whether this is pain from her leg ulcers or her chest. It is therefore possible that she is also getting drug withdrawal symptoms and this is a further contributing factor to cause her restlessness and confusion at night.
- 6.7. She is seen by Dr Lord who does a thorough assessment and arranges for an appropriate transfer to Gosport War Memorial Hospital. It is clear though from the notes that on the day of transfer she is still not right. She had been pyrexial the day before, she had been confused the night before transfer and she is more breathless needing oxygen on the day of transfer. It might have been wiser not to transfer her in this unstable clinical state.
- 6.8. When she is transferred to the Gosport War Memorial Hospital she is seen by Dr Barton who fails to record a clinical examination, apart from a statement regarding her functional status, that she is catheterised, needs two to transfer and needs help with ADL and documents a Barthel of 6. An opportunity to assess her apparent unstable clinical state appears to have been missed. The nursing cardex states the Bartel is 9 (373) and that in the nursing cardex, she can wash with the aid of one and is independent in feeding.
- 6.9. The continuation notes of Dr Barton (77) then mention rehabilitation with a statement about being happy for the nursing staff to confirm death. There are no further medical notes at all

## Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

and in view of the subsequent changing clinical condition documented in the nursing cardex on 19<sup>th</sup> August and that the nurses contacted the doctor (388) this is a poor standard of care. It also makes it very difficult to assess whether appropriate medical management was given to Mrs. Lake.

- 6.10. On admission the regular drugs being prescribed at Haslar were continued but the Paracetamol and Tramadol she had received in the Gosport War Memorial Hospital only a month before were not prescribed, nor was any other milder analgesia such as Paracetamol. The only analgesia written up was Oramorphine on the 'as required' part of the drug prescription. While it is probably appropriate for somebody who might have been having episodes of angina and left ventricular failure while in Gosport to have a Morphine drug available for nurses to give, it is very poor prescribing to write up no other form of analgesia, particularly if a doctor is not on site. The nursing staff could have no alternative but to go straight to a strong opioid analgesia. On her first night she is documented as anxious and confused. This is then treated by giving a dose of Oramorphine despite there being no record in the medical or nursing cardex that it was pain causing this confusion. It should be noted this was probably no different from her evenings in Haslar which did not need any specific medication management. In my view this is poor nursing and medical care in the management of confusion in the evening.
- 6.11. On 19<sup>th</sup> August an event happened at 11.50 in the morning with the nursing notes recording that she had marked chest pain and was grey around her mouth. This could have been a heart attack, it could have been a pulmonary embolus, it could have been another episode of angina, it could simply have been some non-specific chest pain. No investigations are put in train to make a diagnosis, she does not appear to have been medically assessed, or if she was it was not recorded in the notes and would be poor medical practice. However, if the patient was seriously distressed, it would have been appropriate to have given the Oramorphine 10 mgs that was written up on the 'as required' side of the drug chart. The first aim would be to relieve distress while a diagnosis was made.
- 6.12. Later on 19<sup>th</sup> August s syringe driver is started containing Diamorphine 20 mgs and 20 mgs of Midazolam. The only justification for this is recorded in the nursing notes (394) where it says pain is relieved for a short period. I am unable to find any records of observations, for example, pulse or blood pressure



Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

while the patient continues to have pain.

- 6.13. The syringe driver is continued the next day and Hyoscine is added and the dose of Diamorphine, Midazolam and Hyoscine all increase during the afternoon of the 20<sup>th</sup> and again when the syringe driver is replaced on 21<sup>st</sup>. Mrs Lake dies peacefully on 21<sup>st</sup> August.
- 6.14. Diamorphine is specifically prescribed for pain, is commonly used for pain in cardiac disease as well as in terminal care. Diamorphine is compatible with Midazolam and can be mixed in the same syringe driver. Diamorphine subcutaneously after oral morphine is usually given at a maximum ratio of 1 to 2 (up to 10 mgs of Diamorphine for 20 mgs of Oramorphine). She had received 20 mgs of Oramorphine on 19<sup>th</sup> and appears to have been in continuing pain so I think it is probably reasonable to have started with 20 mgs of Diamorphine in the syringe driver over the first 24 hours.
- 6.15. Midazolam is widely used subcutaneously as doses from 5 – 80 mgs per 24 hours and is particularly used for terminal restlessness. The dose of Midazolam used was 20 mgs for the first 24 hours, which is within current guidance, although many believe that elderly patients need a lower dose of 5 – 20 mgs per 24 hours (palliative care). (Chapter 23 in the Brocklehurst's Text Book of Geriatric Medicines 6<sup>th</sup> Edition 2003). The original dose of Diamorphine appeared to be for continued chest pain. It is unusual to use continuous Diamorphine for chest pain without making a specific diagnosis. It is possible the patient had had a myocardial infarction and was now in cardiogenic shock. In that case it would be very reasonable to use a syringe driver and indeed to add Midazolam and Hyoscine over the subsequent 48 hours. This can only be supposition without adequate documentation.
- 6.16. In my view it is impossible from the notes to determine the cause of death and a Coroner's Post Mortem should have been held.

## 7. OPINION

- 7.1. Ruby Lake an 84-year-old lady with a number of chronic diseases, suffers a fall and a fractured neck of femur in August 1998. She is admitted to hospital and has operative treatment but develops post-operative complications including chest infection, chest pain and confusion at night and subsequently deteriorates and dies in the

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Gosport War Memorial Hospital.

- 7.2. In my view a major problem in assessing this case is the poor documentation in Gosport Hospital in both the medical and nursing notes, making a retrospective assessment of her progress difficult. Good Medical Practice (GMC 2001) states that “good clinical care must include adequate assessment of the patient’s condition, based on the history and symptoms and if necessary, an appropriate examination”..... “in providing care you must keep clear, accurate, legible and contemporaneous patient records which report the relevant clinical findings, the decisions made, the information given to patients and any drugs or other treatments prescribed”.... “good clinical care must include – taking suitable prompt action where necessary”.... “prescribe drugs and treatments, including repeat prescriptions only when you have adequate knowledge of the patient’s health and medical needs”. The lack of detail in particular in the medical notes, the lack of recording of why decisions were made or if the patient was properly examined represent poor clinical practice to the standard set by the General Medical Council.

In my view the combination of a lack of a documented clinical examination, the lack of prescription of appropriate oral analgesia on admission to Gosport, the decision to start a syringe driver without documentation of a clinical diagnosis or the reason for it in the medical notes, together represent a negligent standard of medical care.

Without a proven diagnosis, it is possible that the combination of Diamorphine and Midazolam together with the Hyoscine in a syringe driver contributed in part to Mrs Lake's death. However, I am unable to satisfy myself to the standard of beyond reasonable doubt that it made more than a minimal contribution.

## 8 LITERATURE/REFERENCES

1. Good Medical Practice, General Medical Council 2002
2. Withholding withdrawing life, prolonging treatments: Good Practice and decision making. General Medical Council 2002.
3. Palliative Care, Welsh J, Fallon M, Keeley PW. Brocklehurst Text Book of Geriatric Medicine, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition, 2003, Chapter 23 pages 257-270.
4. The treatment of Terminally Ill Geriatric Patients, Wilson JA, Lawson, PM, Smith RG. Palliative Medicine 1987; 1:149-153.

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

5. Accuracy of Prognosis, Estimates by 4 Palliative Care Teams: A Prospective Cohort Study. Higginson IJ, Costantini M. BMC Palliative Care 2002;1:129
6. The Palliative Care Handbook. Guidelines on Clinical Management, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Salisbury Palliative Care Services, May 1995.

## 9. EXPERTS' DECLARATION

1. I understand that my overriding duty is to the court, both in preparing reports and in giving oral evidence. I have complied and will continue to comply with that duty.
2. I have set out in my report what I understand from those instructing me to be the questions in respect of which my opinion as an expert are required.
3. I have done my best, in preparing this report, to be accurate and complete. I have mentioned all matters, which I regard as relevant to the opinions I have expressed. All of the matters on which I have expressed an opinion lie within my field of expertise.
4. I have drawn to the attention of the court all matters, of which I am aware, which might adversely affect my opinion.
5. Wherever I have no personal knowledge, I have indicated the source of factual information.
6. I have not included anything in this report, which has been suggested to me by anyone, including the lawyers instructing me, without forming my own independent view of the matter.
7. Where, in my view, there is a range of reasonable opinion, I have indicated the extent of that range in the report.
8. At the time of signing the report I consider it to be complete and accurate. I will notify those instructing me if, for any reason, I subsequently consider that the report requires any correction or qualification.
9. I understand that this report will be the evidence that I will give under oath, subject to any correction or qualification I may make before swearing to its veracity.
10. I have attached to this report a statement setting out the substance of all facts and instructions given to me which are material to the opinions expressed in this report or upon which those opinions are based.

## 10. STATEMENT OF TRUTH

I confirm that insofar as the facts stated in my report are within my own knowledge I have made clear which they are and I believe them to be true, and the opinions I have expressed represent my true and complete professional opinion.

Version 2 of complete report 29th August 2005 – Ruby Lake

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_